

Program Proposal Evaluation Criteria

Reviewers will perform a peer review of all proposals using the rubric below, with the opportunity to provide comments to the submitting author.

CRITERION	Excellent 4	Good 3	Fair 2	Needs Extensive Improvement 1
Content	The abstract describes an innovative program of immediate relevance and importance for dental education based on current best practices or emerging pedagogy.	The abstract describes a program that is based on current best practices in dental education or emerging pedagogy.	The abstract describes a program related to dental education, but contains few elements that are relevant to best practices in dental education.	The abstract does not clearly indicate its importance and relevance to best practices in dental education.
Clarity	The title, objectives, methods, outcomes and conclusion are clearly and thoroughly described.	The title, objectives, methods, outcomes and conclusion are generally well described.	The title, objectives, methods, outcomes and/or conclusion are unclear.	The title, objectives, methods, outcomes and conclusion are incomplete and/or unclear.
Format	The abstract clearly describes purpose, objectives, methods, appropriate analysis of outcomes data and an accurate, meaningful and concise conclusion.	The abstract adequately describes purpose, objectives, methods, appropriate analysis of outcomes data and conclusion.	The abstract describes a new program but does not clearly describe the purpose, objectives, methods, analysis of outcomes data or conclusion.	The abstract does not describe a new program or is missing the purpose, objectives, methods, analysis of outcomes data or conclusion.
Professional Writing and Protection of Participants	The abstract is clearly written and provides evidence of IRB approval (including Exempt status), if required.	The abstract requires some editing and provides evidence of IRB approval (including Exempt status), if required.	The abstract requires considerable editing, and/or evidence of IRB approval (including Exempt status), if required, is unclear.	The abstract is incomplete, unclear or lacks evidence of IRB approval (including Exempt status), if required.
Contribution	The program will make a significant contribution to multiple areas and aspects of dental education.	The program will make a contribution that will be of interest to areas and aspects of dental education.	The program will make a limited contribution that will be of interest to some areas and aspects of dental education.	The abstract does not identify its contributions to areas and aspects of dental education.