

1-1-2004

# Best Practices Checklist for Running a Faculty Search: From Identification of Needs to Invitation to Interview

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.usu.edu/advance>

 Part of the [Law and Gender Commons](#), and the [Other Education Commons](#)

---

## Recommended Citation

"Best Practices Checklist for Running a Faculty Search: From Identification of Needs to Invitation to Interview" (2004). *ADVANCE Library Collection*. Paper 339.  
<https://digitalcommons.usu.edu/advance/339>

This Checklist is brought to you for free and open access by the Gender Equity and Diversity at DigitalCommons@USU. It has been accepted for inclusion in ADVANCE Library Collection by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@USU. For more information, please contact [dylan.burns@usu.edu](mailto:dylan.burns@usu.edu).



## Best Practices Checklist for Running a Faculty Search: From Identification of Needs to Invitation to Interview

The practices outlined in this worksheet include both recommended best practices and legal requirements for faculty searches. Contact the AA/EEO office to discuss specific legal requirements. Please contact the SERT committee ([rdupo@cc.usu.edu](mailto:rdupo@cc.usu.edu)) with suggestions for improving this worksheet.

### ☐ 1. Clarify faculty needs prior to search

#### a. Faculty members

- ☐ Identify departmental needs prior to formation of search committee
- ☐ Discuss and prioritize departmental needs and desires for new faculty positions

#### b. Department Head

- ☐ Appoints committee after position needs are identified
- ☐ Calls additional faculty meetings, as necessary, to discuss and refine the position further
- ☐ Invites SERT committee to search committee meeting for briefing and assistance, if desired

### ☐ 2. Prepare position announcement and evaluation matrix

#### a. Entire search committee

- ☐ Meets and defines position further, identifying specific research/teaching/extension needs
- ☐ Drafts job position announcement (Click here to view a [sample job description](#))
- ☐ Begins to develop evaluation matrix by which candidates will be screened (Click here to view a [sample matrix](#))
- ☐ Reaches consensus on relative importance and weighting of matrix criteria

#### b. Department Head

- ☐ Circulates announcement and solicits feedback from faculty

#### c. Entire search committee

- ☐ Meets again (at least by e-mail) to discuss faculty feedback and revise job announcement, as necessary
- ☐ Develops long and short versions of position announcement for use in print and web publications
- ☐ Creates final evaluation matrix

### ☐ 3. Advertise position

#### a. Department Head and entire search committee

- ☐ Discuss, identify, and implement specific advertising and networking strategies to improve recruitment of women and minorities (identify and defines 5 points of diversity contacts and advertising plan, submits to AA/EEO)
- ☐ Request faculty support to implement these strategies and broaden applicant pool diversity

#### b. Department Head

- ☐ Works closely with AA/EEO and Human Resources to publicize position
- ☐ Works with office staff to confirm receipt of applications as received

### ☐ 4. Conduct initial screening of applicants

#### a. For application pools of any size, entire search committee

- ☐ Reviews all applications confidentially to protect the identity of applicants
- ☐ Discusses applications with no one but other search committee members

#### b. Individual search committee members

- ☐ May divide workload in large searches (over 50 applications) by doing the following:
  - Work with another committee member to evaluate an assigned subset of applications
  - Work with another committee member to review assigned applications using matrix criteria and eliminating applicants who do not meet minimum requirements or score poorly in the opinion of both members
  - Repeat the previous process with additional sets, as time allows. All committee members should feel free to review their colleagues' decisions.
- ☐ Request that the whole committee review any specific applications that warrant special attention.
- ☐ Review all applications in smaller pools (fewer than 50) using the evaluation matrix

☐ **5. Conduct in-depth screening of applications**

**a. Entire search committee**

- ☐ Meets to review and discuss individual committee member's evaluations of candidates (based on evaluation matrix)
  - All members may present their evaluations during the discussion of each candidate, or
  - The committee chair may assign specific candidate files to individual committee members to present. (Committee members become familiar with all files, but the individual members bring assigned candidates into better focus for committee. If the committee chooses this strategy, then the entire committee participates in a candidate review session in which committee members present candidate files and evaluations for group discussion.)
  - Systematically discusses all viable candidates for the position (those not eliminated in initial screening)
- ☐ Sorts applicants into three categories:
  - *Group 1:* Very strong candidates (working short list), who are recommended for closest further look. The committee should aim for a list of twelve or fewer candidates from which they will select a group to interview
  - *Group 2:* Reasonably strong candidates (backup for short list); these individuals may become candidates on the short list at a later time
  - *Group 3:* Clearly less qualified candidates (can be eliminated at this point for all practical purposes, given the number ranked higher in the pool)
- ☐ Using the evaluation matrix criteria, identifies why all applicants not in Group 3 or those eliminated in the initial screening have not been ranked in the top two groups.
- ☐ Check references for those in the top two groups

**b. Committee chair**

- ☐ Maintains records of all rankings
- ☐ Concludes the in-depth screening meeting(s) by reviewing candidate groupings and identifying reasons for applicant elimination from the pool
- ☐ Requests consensus from the group for the decisions made
- ☐ Communicates with applicants and notifies those who are not selected for the finalist pool.

☐ **6. Conduct final screening of applicants (selection of candidates for on-campus interviews)**

**a. Individual search committee members**

- ☐ Review highest ranking applications again, reviewing and refining the evaluation matrix as needed
- ☐ Review other lower-ranking applications, as necessary, to assure themselves that all candidates have been judged fairly
- ☐ Alert other committee members by email if he or she thinks an eliminated application deserves additional screening or consideration and request reconsideration

**b. Entire search committee**

- ☐ Considers whether any lower-ranked applicants require reconsideration or re-evaluation of rank
- ☐ Pauses to consider whether any other reconsiderations should be made (especially to move a candidate from the third to the second category or second to first category)
- ☐ Arranges phone interviews for all those in the top group. Individual committee members conduct phone interviews to determine each candidate's interest, assess communication skills, clarify resume, and gather additional information. (Click [here to view sample phone interview questions.](#))
- ☐ Integrates results from phone interviews and obtains consensus on which candidates among the top group should be invited for an interview
- ☐ Identifies reasons why other applicants are not selected for interviews
- ☐ Identifies reasons why the applicants invited to campus were chosen

☐ **7. Get administrative approval and invite candidates to interview**

**Department Head**

- ☐ Submits paperwork to request interviews
- ☐ Upon approval, invites identified candidates to campus
- ☐ Committee consults with SERT member on best practices for on-campus interviews
- ☐ While candidates are on campus, schedule meeting for candidate to meet with a SERT member

SERT Best Practices, p. 2

April 16, 2004

Please send comments about this checklist  
to Ryan Dupont, SERT Chair, at [rdupo@cc.usu.edu](mailto:rdupo@cc.usu.edu)

## **SERT - Boilerplate Possibilities for Job Advertisements**

1. Utah State University is an affirmative action/equal opportunity employer, sensitive to the needs of dual-career applicants. The University was recently chosen as a National Science Foundation ADVANCE Gender Equity Program recipient. The University is sensitive to the needs of dual-career applicants and is dedicated to recruiting stellar candidates from a diverse pool including women, minorities, veterans and people with disabilities. USU offers competitive salaries and outstanding medical, retirement and professional benefits (<http://personnel.usu.edu/>). USU is in Logan, Utah, a semi-rural city in an Alpine mountain valley with a community of 100,000, offering ample opportunities for family-friendly professional life. Ski resorts, lakes, rivers, and mountains in the area make it one of the finest outdoor recreation environments in the nation.

2. Utah State University is a Carnegie-I research school of 20,000 students, nestled in a mountain valley 80 miles north of Salt Lake City, Utah. Opportunities for a wide range of outdoor activities are plentiful. Housing costs are at or below national averages, and Cache Valley provides a supportive environment for families and balanced personal/professional life. USU offers competitive salaries and outstanding medical, retirement and professional benefits (see <http://personnel.usu.edu/> for details). Women, minority, veteran and disabled candidates are encouraged to apply, and USU is sensitive to the needs of dual-career couples. Utah State University is an affirmative action/equal opportunity employer, with a National Science Foundation ADVANCE Gender Equity program, committed to increasing diversity among students, faculty, and all participants in university life.

---

## Sample Position Announcement

The following is an example of a position announcement. It is, perhaps, on the long side. Some details appearing here might be placed in the online position announcement. In writing the position announcement and the evaluation "matrix," care must be taken that the matrix does not evaluate on criteria which are not stated or implied in some position announcement.

**The Chemical Engineering Department at Utah State University<sup>1</sup>:** Teach and research in a beautiful Rocky Mountain valley. The department seeks outstanding candidates for a tenure track position at the assistant professor rank in the area of polymers and material science. Applicants must have an earned PhD at the time of appointment in Chemical Engineering or a closely related field, be committed to excellence in teaching, and have demonstrated research excellence. Successful candidates will be expected to develop an independent research program, to teach graduate and undergraduate courses, to develop new courses, work collaboratively with existing efforts, and to be involved in K-12 outreach. Relevant experience a plus. The department has strengths in computational methods, process control, petroleum fracturing, and rheology with research funding at approx. \$9M annually, 80 undergraduate and 140 graduate students. Further information is available at [usu.learnmoreproff.edu](http://usu.learnmoreproff.edu). Applicants should send a detailed CV, statements of teaching and research interests, and names and addresses of at least three references to: Prof. Hy R. Menow, Chair, Search Comm. Dept. of Chem. Engr., Utah State University, Logan, UT 84322-9999. Review of applications will begin Jan 31, 2003.

Utah State University is an affirmative action/equal opportunity employer, sensitive to the needs of dual-career applicants. The University was recently chosen as a National Science Foundation ADVANCE Gender Equity Program recipient. The University is sensitive to the needs of dual-career applicants and dedicated to recruiting stellar candidates from a diverse pool including women, minorities, veterans and people with disabilities. USU offers competitive salaries and outstanding medical, retirement and professional benefits (<http://personnel.usu.edu>). USU is in Logan, Utah, a semi-rural city in an Alpine mountain valley with a community of 100,000, offering ample opportunities for family-friendly professional life. Ski resorts, lakes, rivers, and mountains in the area make it one of the finest outdoor recreation environments in the nation.

---

<sup>1</sup> This is a fictitious department created for illustrative purposes only.

# Candidate Evaluation Matrix

The following candidate matrix which is intended to be suggestive rather than proscriptive. This is a tool which can be modified to suit the needs of the search.

Name	Bob First	Samantha Second	Aretha Thyrd
PhD in Chem.E. or closely related?			
Specialization in polymers or material science?			
Grad. Yr.			
Total # pubs			
Journal/archival pubs?			
Conf/workshop pubs?			
Quality of pubs (Impact)			
Ability or experience in attracting external funding			
Undergraduate teaching			
Graduate teaching			
outreach?			
Multidisciplinary experience			
Letters of recommendation			

## Notes:

1. In some categories, an appropriate indication is "go/no go" — have certain minimum qualifications been met (such as completed PhD). In others, a numeric score may be helpful. In others, the space might be used as a basis for making notes about particular qualifications.
2. The graduation year might be useful to gage the rate of production and experience of the applicant. However, age discrimination laws mean that this information must be used with circumspection.
3. For some positions, it may be valuable to have a more fine-grained breakdown. For example, for one search, categories such as "Computer and statistical competence and experience" or "Ability to collaborate closely with xxx team," "Ability to manage technician." In all cases, care should be taken that the matrix evaluates criteria which are stated or implied in the position announcement, either published or on the web. For example, "Post doctoral experience" might be a plus, but unless stated in the announcement, it may not be valid for consideration.
4. It may be helpful to have the boxes of the matrix sufficiently large that notes regarding the applicants can be used, rather than some numerical score.



# Resources for Women and Minority Recruiting in Sciences and Engineering

## **Minority Resources**

***The Black Issues in Higher Education*** web site has job listings and a news magazine dedicated exclusively to minority issues in higher education.

<http://www.blackissues.com/092503/>

***Future Black Faculty Database (FBF)*** Developed at UC Berkeley, the FBF Database contains records of doctoral candidates, recent graduates, and professionals seeking positions in academia. All database members are of African descent and plan to obtain a tenure track faculty position within five to seven years. The focus of the database is on persons studying engineering or the natural sciences. Access to the database is free.

<http://bgess.berkeley.edu/faculty/>

***Hispanic Outlook*** is a national magazine that focuses on issues affecting minorities and minority issues in higher education.

<http://www.hispanicoutlook.com/>

***IMDiversity.com*** provides minority professionals with comprehensive job seeking and career management tools. <http://www.iminorities.com/>

***Minority On-Line Information Service (MOLIS)*** The MOLIS web site provides an opportunity for a department to search specifically for advanced degree programs offered through 164 Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HSBUs), Hispanic Serving Institutions (HSIs) and other academic institutions. Mailing addresses of these minority institutions are also available on this web site. <http://web.fie.com/molis/>

***National Minority Faculty Identification Program (NMFI)*** Educational institutions join NMFI Program for \$200. Program advertises its roster of member institutions four times a year in *The Chronicle* and invites candidates to submit their CVs for consideration by member institutions. NMFI Program produces four times a year (October, November, January, and March) a computerized directory of the abbreviated resumes, indexed

by discipline. Using this directory, member institutions may request up to 25 dossiers free of charge, thereafter, dossiers are \$1.00 each. NMFI Program data bank contains 990 dossiers.

<http://www.southwestern.edu/academic/minority-fac/minority-fac-home.html>

***The Society for the Advancement of Chicanos and Native Americans in Science*** The mission of SACNAS is to encourage Chicano/Latino and Native American students to pursue graduate education and obtain the advanced degrees necessary for research careers and science teaching professions at all levels. <http://www.sacnas.org/>.

***The Society of Hispanic Professional Engineers (SHPE)*** was founded in Los Angeles, California, in 1974 by a group of engineers employed by the city of Los Angeles. Their objective was to form a national organization of professional engineers to serve as role models in the Hispanic community. <http://www.shpe.org/>

## **Women in Science and Engineering**

***American Association of University Women*** This national organization is committed to promoting education and equity for all women and girls. Their commitment to these issues is reflected in their public policy efforts, programs, and diversity initiatives. The following web site can be used to advertise faculty positions: <http://www.aauw.org/9000/jobmkt.html>.  
<http://www.aauw.org/>

***Association for Women Geoscientists*** The Association for Women Geoscientists promotes the professional development of its members, provides geosciences outreach to girls, and encourages women to become geoscientists. Assists employment offices in complying with Affirmative Action regulations by putting AWG forward as the principle instrument for reaching women geoscientists through Gaea and its electronic publication venues. <http://www.awg.org/>

***Association for Women in Science (AWIS)*** AWIS fosters the achievement of women in science, mathematics, engineering and technology. Founded in 1971, the Association for Women in Science (AWIS) is a non-profit professional society dedicated to achieving equity and full participation for



women in all areas of science and technology. The following are just a few of the available web site links that can be used for posting academic positions: AWIS Job Listings, Women's Work Classified and Job Bank.  
<http://www.awis.org/>

***Committee on Institutional Cooperation (CIC) Directory – Women in Science & Engineering (WISE)*** In 1993, the CIC created the Panel on Women in Science and Engineering (WISE) with the purpose of coordinating activities across the consortium that are designed to recruit, retain, and advance women scientists and engineers; publishing the CIC Directory of Women in Science and Engineering PhD Candidates and Recipients and Postdoctoral Appointees is one such activity. This directory lists women who have recently completed their Ph.D. degree at a CIC University in the fields of science, engineering, and mathematics. Each entry includes the student's name, ethnicity, address, phone number, institution, department, field, optional specialization areas, dissertation title, date of degree, and faculty advisor. The directory is indexed by field of study.  
<http://www.cic.uiuc.edu/wise/wisedir.html>

***Women in Cell Biology (American Society for Cell Biology/ASCB)*** This web site contains information about prominent women scientists in a variety of fields. The WICB Committee recognizes outstanding achievements in cell biology by presenting two Career Recognition Awards at the ASCB Annual Meeting. The Junior Award is given to a woman in an early stage of her career (assistant professor or equivalent) who has made exceptional scientific contributions to cell biology and exhibits the potential for continuing a high level of scientific endeavor while fostering the career development of young scientists. The Senior Award is also given to a scientist in a later career stage. <http://www.ascb.org/commit/wicb.html>

***Women in Higher Education (WIHE)*** WIHE “is the only national monthly practitioner's news journal to **enlighten, encourage, empower, and enrage.**” <http://www.wihe.com/>

***Women in Endocrinology (WE)*** This organization is devoted to promoting and facilitating the professional development and advancement of women in the field of Endocrinology. It identifies promising young women in Endocrinology and provides opportunities for networking, career guidance,

role models, and assistance in moving up the professional ladder.  
<http://www.women-in-endo.org/Pages/index.shtml>

***Women In Neuroscience (WIN)*** Women in Neuroscience (WIN) is an organization whose goal is to promote the professional development of women neuroscientists at all career levels. WIN sponsors graduate students and postdoctoral fellows to attend the Annual Meeting of the Society for Neuroscience and the WIN career development workshop. The following web site is available to advertise faculty positions:  
<http://www.beemnet.com/win/>. <http://www.sfn.org/win.html>

### **General Resources**

***Directory of Ford Fellows*** The directory contains information on Ford Foundation Postdoctoral fellowship recipients awarded since 1980 and for Foundation Predoctoral and dissertation fellowship recipients awarded since 1986. The database is sorted alphabetically by last name and includes current institution, field of study, and year/level of award.  
<http://www4.nas.edu/ffellows/ffellows.nsf>

***The Higher Education Resource Hub*** The goal of this evolving website is to provide a comprehensive collection of information resources in the field of higher education throughout the world. <http://www.higher-ed.org/>

***Minority & Women Doctoral Directory*** This directory lists approximately 4,500 Black, Hispanic, American Indian, Asian and women students in nearly 80 fields in the sciences, engineering, social sciences and humanities. Each entry includes name, local/permanent address and telephone number(s), ethnicity/citizenship, department and areas of specialization, date of completion, dissertation title (with current employment/postdoctoral appointments), and name and address of the faculty advisor, entries are indexed by field of study. <http://www.mwdd.com>

***UC President Postdoctoral Fellowship Program*** Started in 1984, the President's Postdoctoral Fellowship Program offers postdoctoral fellowships which support the conduct of research and mentoring. The expectation is that many of the fellows will be seriously considered for faculty appointments at UC. <http://www.ucop.edu/acadadv/fgsas/f-contrs.html>