

AMERICAN DENTAL EDUCATION ASSOCIATION

ADEA CLIMATE STUDY

**Advancing a
Humanistic Environment
within Dental Education
Strategic Roadmap**

ADEA | THE VOICE OF
DENTAL EDUCATION

Contents

Overview	3
A Focus on Supporting CODA Accreditation Standard: Humanistic Environment	3
Call to Action:	6
Measuring Impact:	6
Exploratory Criteria to Use When Selecting Key Implementation Activities	6
Goal #1	7
Humanistic & Inclusive Environment.....	8
Goal #2.....	12
Equitable Policies & Practices	14
Goal #3.....	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Bias & Discrimination – Take Action Pledge	18
Goal #4.....	23
ADEA Support of Campuses Actively Working to Advance a Humanistic Environment within Dental Education	23
Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Spectrum Tool	24
Sample Campus-level Goal Setting	30

ADEA Climate Study: Advancing a Humanistic Environment within Dental Education Roadmap

Overview

The ADEA climate assessment survey was conducted in spring 2022 and included 258 participating U.S. and Canadian dental schools and allied dental education programs. ADEA partnered with Nonprofit HR, a private consulting group, to develop and implement the ADEA climate survey. Participation was free and open to all U.S. and Canadian dental schools and allied dental education programs.

The ADEA Climate Study, the result of the survey, is a crucial step in measuring dental education's efforts to foster a humanistic and inclusive environment. The baseline data collected will be used to develop strategic priorities and activities, serve as a benchmark for future data collection activities and assist dental education in gauging future progress.

Over the past several months since campuses received their individualized campus-level data, ADEA has been working with Nonprofit HR to determine areas of strategic focus based on the data findings. As outlined in this strategic roadmap, the following areas will be focused on over the next three years: 1) Humanistic and Inclusive Environment, 2) Equitable Policies and Practices and 3) Bias and Discrimination. This roadmap outlines actionable opportunities or key implementation activities and strategies for campuses to engage in advancing diversity, equity, inclusion and belonging (DEIB) on their respective campuses. Campuses are asked to engage in all three goals based on their campus needs and are not limited to the strategies outlined in this roadmap.

A Focus on Supporting CODA Accreditation Standard: Humanistic Environment

The Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA) Accreditation Standard focusing on a humanistic environment will serve as the foundation for this strategic roadmap. This alignment will provide dental schools and allied dental education programs with the opportunity to align their strategic priorities further to meet accreditation standards.

Predoctoral

Humanistic environment dental schools are societies of learners, where graduates are prepared to join a learned and a scholarly society of oral health professionals. A humanistic pedagogy inculcates respect, tolerance, understanding and concern for others and is fostered by mentoring, advising and small group interaction. A dental school environment characterized by respectful professional relationships between and among faculty and students establishes a context for the development of interpersonal skills necessary for learning, for patient care and for making meaningful contributions to the profession.

- 1-4 The dental school must have policies and practices to:
- a. achieve appropriate levels of diversity among its students, faculty and staff;*
 - b. engage in ongoing systematic and focused efforts to attract and retain students, faculty and staff from diverse backgrounds; and*
 - c. systematically evaluate comprehensive strategies to improve the institutional climate for diversity.*

Intent: The dental school should develop strategies to address the dimensions of diversity, including structure, curriculum and institutional climate. The dental school should articulate its expectations regarding diversity across its academic community in the context of local and national responsibilities, and regularly assess how well such expectations are being achieved. Schools could incorporate elements of diversity in their planning that include, but are

not limited to gender, racial, ethnic, cultural and socioeconomic. Schools should establish focused, significant and sustained programs to recruit and retain suitably diverse students, faculty and staff.

- 2-17 Graduates must be competent in managing a diverse patient population and have the interpersonal and communications skills to function successfully in a multicultural work environment.

Intent: Students should learn about factors and practices associated with disparities in health status among subpopulations, including but not limited to racial, ethnic, geographic or socioeconomic groups. In this manner, students will be best prepared for dental practice in a diverse society when they learn in an environment characterized by, and supportive of, diversity and inclusion. Such an environment should facilitate dental education in:

- *Basic principles of culturally competent health care;*
- *Basic principles of health literacy and effective communication for all patient populations;*
- *Recognition of health care disparities and the development of solutions;*
- *The importance of meeting the health care needs of dentally underserved populations; and*
- *The development of core professional attributes, such as altruism, empathy and social accountability, needed to provide effective care in a multidimensionally diverse society.*

Dental Hygiene

- 1-2 The program must have a stated commitment to a humanistic culture and learning environment that is regularly evaluated.

Intent: The program should ensure collaboration, mutual respect, cooperation and harmonious relationships between and among administrators, faculty, students, staff and alumni. The program should also support and cultivate the development of professionalism and ethical behavior by fostering diversity of faculty, students and staff, open communication, leadership and scholarship.

Examples of evidence to demonstrate compliance may include:

- *Established policies regarding ethical behavior by faculty, staff and students that are regularly reviewed and readily available;*
- *Student, faculty and patient groups involved in promoting diversity, professionalism and/or leadership support for their activities; and*
- *Focus groups and/or surveys directed towards gathering information on student, faculty, patient and alumni perceptions of the cultural environment.*

Dental Therapy

- 1-3 The dental therapy education program must have a stated commitment to a humanistic culture and learning environment that is regularly evaluated.

Intent: The dental therapy education program should ensure collaboration, mutual respect, cooperation and harmonious relationships between and among administrators, faculty, students, staff and alumni. The program should also support and cultivate the development of professionalism and ethical behavior by fostering diversity of faculty, students and staff, open communication, leadership and scholarship.

Examples of evidence to demonstrate compliance may include:

- *Established policies regarding ethical behavior by faculty, staff and students that are regularly reviewed and readily available;*
- *Student, faculty and patient groups involved in promoting diversity, professionalism and/or leadership support for their activities; and*
- *Focus groups and/or surveys directed towards gathering information on student, faculty, patient and alumni perceptions of the cultural environment.*

Call to Action

Over the next three years, ADEA will invite and encourage all deans and program directors to work to **address goals 1-3 as outlined in this roadmap**. Recognizing that each campus is uniquely different based on composition, location, available resources, current initiatives that focus on creating a humanistic environment (CODA standard), etc., we have developed multiple opportunities for **campuses to self-select how to participate based on their needs and current state**. To help narrow down options for campuses, each key implementation activity will be assigned emerging, proficient and advanced.

Measuring Impact

Each participating campus will be asked to report their progress at the end of each year as an opportunity for ADEA to continue to gather essential data to track overall progress, quantify participation and celebrate the success of our participating campuses. A yearly report will highlight traction across dental education via dashboards, elevate success stories and share best practices that can be adapted and modeled across institutions. Our goal is to strive towards creating a more diverse, equitable and inclusive environment within our dental schools and allied dental education programs where all community members have a heightened sense of belonging. Ultimately, as we prepare for a future benchmarking Climate Study, we have set ambitious targets that will track success and impact future generations of students, faculty, staff and administrators within oral health education.

Campus-level Participation & Confidentiality in Reporting

Consistent with CODA standards, all ADEA Climate Study strategic priorities, including this pledge, have been designed to foster a more humanistic and inclusive environment across dental education and prepare for future benchmarking studies that will track our collective progress. Therefore, ADEA will continue to adhere to all data collection processes executed during the 2022 Climate Study to ensure that participating campus data remain unidentifiable in all progress reports and dashboards. To ensure confidentiality, all data shared will be in the aggregate form. The data we share will NOT include information about individual participants or data identifying individual schools or programs. As campuses decide which commitments they will focus on, they will be provided with the data points they will be asked to report back to ADEA to track progress across dental education. Most of the reporting will focus on participation numbers to quantify the impact.

Every participating campus within dental education is uniquely different, so campuses will self-select how they participate in this pledge. We encourage you to determine how your campus participates by reviewing your campus-level data to determine growth opportunities. We aim to empower campuses to make necessary changes and provide tools rather than evaluate how your campus does it. Accountability at the campus level is your commitment to participation, not how well your campus performs. No judgment, repercussions or comparisons will be made based on your campus's level of engagement. ADEA's role is to support your commitment to this pledge. With permission, campuses that are excelling or instituting best practices will be celebrated and recognized for their contributions and asked to share their successful practices with other dental schools and programs to create a learning environment.

Exploratory Criteria to Use When Selecting Key Implementation Activities

- Refer back to your campus-level data findings to determine areas of opportunity.
- Explore current campus-level strategic initiatives that can easily be aligned.
- Use the DEI Spectrum Tool to evaluate your campus's readiness level. Based on your self-assessment, explore activities associated with emerging, proficient or advanced to narrow down options.
- Seek feedback from your campus partners or DEI Committee to assist with determining your commitments.

Area of Focus	Humanistic & Inclusive Environment	
Goal #1	To create a campus-level culture and environment that values and promotes diversity, inclusion, equity and belonging (DEIB), where all campus members (students, faculty, staff and administrators) feel respected, valued and able to contribute their unique perspectives and talents.	
2022 Baseline Indicators & Measurements		Impact Targets for Dental Education
Overall, 64% of participants reported they agreed or strongly agreed that they were satisfied with the climate at their dental school/allied dental education program.		Increase the overall baseline to 69% of participants who agreed or strongly agreed that they were satisfied with the climate at their dental school/allied dental education program.
<u>U.S. Dental School</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 64.76% agree, “My dental school/allied dental education program environment is humanistic.” 61.47% agree, “The leadership at my dental school/allied dental education program is committed to fostering a humanistic environment.” <u>U.S. Allied Dental Education Programs</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 78.24% agree, “My dental school/allied dental education program environment is humanistic.” 76.79% agree, “The leadership at my dental school/allied dental education program is committed to fostering a humanistic environment.” <u>Canada</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 62.97% agree, “My dental school/allied dental education program environment is humanistic.” 60.86% agree, “The leadership at my dental school/allied dental education program is committed to fostering a humanistic environment.” 		<u>U.S. Dental School</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increase baseline to 70% who agree, “My dental school/allied dental education program environment is humanistic.” Increase baseline to 66% who agree, “The leadership at my dental school/allied dental education program is committed to fostering a humanistic environment.” <u>U.S. Allied Dental Education Programs</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increase baseline to 83% who agree that “My dental school/allied dental education program environment is humanistic.” Increase baseline to 82% who agree, “The leadership at my dental school/allied dental education program is committed to fostering a humanistic environment.” <u>Canada</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increase baseline to 68% who agree, “My dental school/allied dental education program environment is humanistic.” Increase baseline to 66% who agree, “The leadership at my dental school/allied dental education program is committed to fostering a humanistic environment.”
The mean Inclusive Culture composite score was 3.90.		The mean Inclusive Culture composite score will be greater than 4.10 .
Across U.S. dental schools (79%), U.S. allied dental education programs (86%) and Canada (83%) felt that their program was supportive of its racially and ethnically diverse members.		Across U.S. dental schools (84%), U.S. allied dental education programs (91%) and Canada (88%), felt that their program was supportive of its racially and ethnically diverse members.
Across U.S. dental schools (78%), U.S. allied dental education programs (84%) and Canada (84%) felt that their school or program promotes the appreciation of diversity.		Across U.S. dental schools (83%), U.S. allied dental education programs (89%) and Canada (85%) felt that their school or program promotes the appreciation of diversity.
The mean Inclusive Environment composite score was 3.64.		The mean Inclusive Environment composite score will be greater than 3.82 .

Humanistic & Inclusive Environment

Key Implementation Activities & Strategies	Accountable Party	Campus Readiness Level (Emerging, Proficient and Advanced)	Recommended Execution Timeframe
<p><i>Note: The following key implementation activities and strategies are recommendations for your campus to consider when working towards the outlined goal. The accountable party will vary from campus to campus and should be assigned to an individual, department, committee, etc., to track progress. What gets measured gets done! The campus readiness level was designed to help campuses determine what key implementation strategies align with their current state. We recommend taking the Meyer DEI Spectrum Tool to help gauge your current state. The Recommended Execution Timeframe is a recommendation and will vary from campus to campus and should be used as an exploratory timeframe for design and implementation.</i></p>			
Create a Vision Statement for diversity, equity, inclusion and belonging (DEIB).		Emerging	3 months
Conduct stay interviews focusing on environmental factors, workstyles, benefits, management practices, training, and development to increase retention and enhance your campus environment for staff.		Emerging	3 months
Be transparent with goals and actions. Clearly communicate your campus DEIB goals, objectives and expectations. Share data findings, action steps and success metrics.		Emerging	3 months
Audit where students spend the most time convening and find ways to leverage these spaces to increase belonging.		Emerging	4 months
Include questions around bias and DEIB in coursework/professor evaluations where possible.		Emerging	3 months
Team-building activities: Organize activities that promote collaboration, identity exploration, understanding and a sense of belonging.		Emerging	6 months
Develop targeted programs for campus leadership to model behaviors of a humanistic environment.		Emerging	6 months
Provide professional development funds that focus on advancing DEIB.		Emerging	3 months
Inclusive language and communication: Encourage the use of inclusive language in all campus communications, policies and marketing materials to create a more welcoming environment for all:		Emerging	Ongoing (3-6 months for initial set-up)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Incorporate name pronunciation tools for emails and registration processes (i.e., coursework rosters, workshop sign-ups, etc.) to ensure that names are pronounced correctly. Incorporate the use of pronouns as a normed practice. 		Emerging	3 months

Key Implementation Activities & Strategies	Accountable Party	Campus Readiness Level (Emerging, Proficient and Advanced)	Recommended Execution Timeframe
Provide education on cultural humility, stereotyping, forms of harassment and microaggressions.		Emerging	6 months
Develop DEIB centered calendar of events (i.e., cultural celebrations, awareness, advocacy days).		Emerging	8 months
Inclusive campus events and programming: Organize events and programs that celebrate diverse cultures, traditions and identities:		Emerging	Ongoing (3-6 months for first event)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Education on mental health challenges to reduce stigma, illuminate resources and provide more comprehensive support to campus members. 		Emerging	8 months
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Host a campus wellness day with varying wellness activities for students, faculty and staff. 		Emerging	6 months
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contract external speakers/facilitators who can conduct lunch-and-learn around specific DEIB topics. 		Emerging	6 months
Support diversity and cultural student organizations. Allocate resources and support to student organizations that promote diversity and cultural awareness.		Emerging	3 months
Feedback mechanisms: Encourage open and constructive feedback. Share multiple information-gathering tools.		Emerging	Ongoing
Develop rewards and recognitions for community members, advancing a humanistic campus environment.		Emerging	2 months
Create an intentional strategy to engage with historically marginalized campus members to foster greater inclusion.		Proficient	3 months
Define accountability for your campus and communicate it.		Proficient	3 months
Develop DEIB-related competencies for all community members. Execute and evaluate.		Proficient	4 months
Collaborative decision-making: Adopt an inclusive decision-making model. Involve multiple stakeholders in decision-making processes to prevent individual biases from dominating the outcome. Rely on data and evidence-based approaches in decision-making rather than personal opinions or assumptions.		Proficient	6 months (create & adopt); 9-12 months (training & execution)
Accessible facilities and services: Ensure campus facilities and services are accessible to all, including individuals with disabilities. Make necessary adjustments to accommodate different needs.		Proficient	9 months

Key Implementation Activities & Strategies	Accountable Party	Campus Readiness Level (Emerging, Proficient and Advanced)	Recommended Execution Timeframe
Provide inclusive teaching training to all faculty.		Proficient	Ongoing (6 months for the first training)
Ensure that faculty use varying learning methodologies and approaches to support varying learning modalities.		Proficient	9 months
Host open conversations and/or workshops at least quarterly to have conversations about DEI to build a culture of trust.		Proficient	Ongoing (3-6 months for first event)
Development of student, faculty and staff knowledge on disparities of health care and structural barriers to access care.		Proficient	Ongoing
Create more formal and informal opportunities for students, faculty and staff to build relationships and foster greater trust across the campus.		Proficient	Ongoing
Develop affinity groups or employee resource groups.		Proficient	3-9 months
Consider incorporating summer bridge opportunities for incoming students to help mitigate academic gaps due to varying education access levels.		Proficient	12 months
Ensure all selection committees undergo annual bias reduction training before admitting, hiring or awarding.		Proficient	6 months
Initiate a process of appreciative inquiry with active alums to understand their reasons for staying engaged after graduation (or staying employed) at your campus and identify what the campus can do to actively foster these outcomes in more significant numbers.		Proficient	4 months
Reimagine the onboarding and orientation processes to ensure DEIB is embedded in the curriculum.		Proficient	4-6 months
Develop onboarding guide around DEIB practices for new staff and faculty.		Proficient	6 months
Create anonymous feedback loops to share bias or DEIB concerns.		Proficient	4 months
Ensure all community members have access to mental health services. Consider strategic partnerships with mental health apps and in-person services.		Proficient	9-12 months
Perform coursework audit to ensure that texts used and materials reflect cultural competency.		Proficient	12 months
Ensure that all website content, visuals and communications are accessible.		Proficient	9 months
Invest in mentoring programs and opportunities for marginalized identities both at the campus level and within dentistry.		Advanced	6 months

Key Implementation Activities & Strategies	Accountable Party	Campus Readiness Level (Emerging, Proficient and Advanced)	Recommended Execution Timeframe
Evaluate current mentorship programs and identify gaps in support for historically underrepresented populations in dental education.		Advanced	2-4 months
Pay equity and promotion transparency: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Conduct regular pay equity audits to ensure fair compensation practices across gender, race and other identity dimensions. Promote transparency in promotion and career progression processes, including clear criteria and performance evaluation standards. 		Advanced	Ongoing (6-9 months for the first audit)
Diverse representation in leadership: Work towards increasing the representation of diverse groups in leadership positions across the campus, including in administration, faculty, and student leadership roles.		Advanced	9-12 months
Collect data on social identities and roles. Track reporting based on social identities and roles to determine trends that require action. Additional areas to consider within trend data: applications, retention, etc.		Advanced	Ongoing (3-6 months for initial set-up)

Area of Focus	Equitable Policies & Practices
Goal #2	Campuses will aim to implement comprehensive, equitable and inclusive policies and procedures that foster diversity, equity, inclusion and belonging (DEIB) at all levels.

2022 Baseline Indicators & Measurements	Impact Targets for Dental Education
62% of study participants agreed or strongly agreed that their dental school or allied dental education program has effective strategic diversity goals and plans.	Increase baseline to 67% of study participants who agreed or strongly agreed that their dental school or allied dental education program has effective strategic diversity goals and plans.
63% of study participants agreed or strongly agreed that their dental school/allied dental education program has effective admissions practices and policies that increase student diversity.	Increase baseline to 68% of study participants who agreed or strongly agreed that their dental school/allied dental education program has effective admissions practices and policies that increase student diversity.
<p><u>Students, faculty, staff and administrators</u> reported that they have experienced <u>bias or inequities</u> in relation to the following policies or practices at your dental school/allied dental education programs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 23% Code of conduct or discipline policy • 17% Whistleblower, anti-retaliation policy • 20% Anti-harassment/anti-bullying policy • 22% Discrimination policy/equal opportunity policy • 22% Dress code, personal appearance and attire policies • 18% Result of reactions or responses to contemporary societal events <p><u>Students</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 19% Student recruitment • 22% Student admissions application • 23% Student admissions process • 26% Attendance • 21% Campus safety • 24% Student academic policy • 25% Student scholarship, grant programs • 19% Student honor award • 20% Student mentorship • 22% Selection for a student leadership position 	<p>Decrease the percentage of students, faculty, staff and administrators reported that they have experienced <u>bias or inequities</u> in relation to the following policies or practices at your dental school/allied dental education programs to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 18% Code of conduct or discipline policy • 12% Whistleblower, anti-retaliation policy • 15% Anti-harassment/anti-bullying policy • 17% Discrimination policy/equal opportunity policy • 17% Dress code, personal appearance and attire policies • 13% Result of reactions or responses to contemporary societal events <p><u>Students</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 14% Student recruitment • 17% Student admissions application • 18% Student admissions process • 21% Attendance • 16% Campus safety • 19% Student academic policy • 20% Student scholarship, grant programs • 14% Student honor award • 20% Student mentorship • 17% Selection for a student leadership position

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 18% Student research or writing opportunity <p><u>Faculty, Staff and Administrators</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 18% Interviewing and/or hiring • 16% Employee recruitment • 17% Vacation and time-off policy • 14% Family and medical leave • 11% Child care, elder care, adoption policies and practices • 15% Workplace safety • 28% Compensation • 20% Faculty promotion and tenure • 19% Faculty development and mentorship • 18% Faculty teaching and service assignment • 19% Staff career advancement • 18% Staff career development 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 13% Student research or writing opportunity <p><u>Faculty, Staff and Administrators</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 13% Interviewing and/or hiring • 11% Employee recruitment • 12% Vacation and time-off policy • 9% Family and medical leave • 6% Child care, elder care, adoption policies and practices • 10% Workplace safety • 23% Compensation • 15% Faculty promotion and tenure • 14% Faculty development and mentorship • 13% Faculty teaching and service assignment • 14% Staff career advancement • 13% Staff career development
<p><u>U.S. Dental Schools</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 54.88% of faculty and staff agree, “My dental school/allied dental education program has effective hiring practices and policies that increase faculty diversity.” • 54.56% of faculty and staff agree, “My dental school/allied dental education program has effective hiring practices and policies that increase <u>staff</u> diversity.” <p><u>U.S. Allied Dental Education Programs</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 62.24% of faculty and staff agree, “My dental school/allied dental education program has effective hiring practices and policies that increase faculty diversity.” • 59.82% of faculty and staff agree, “My dental school/allied dental education program has effective hiring practices and policies that increase <u>staff</u> diversity.” <p><u>Canada</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 52.41% of faculty and staff agree, “My dental school/allied dental education program has effective hiring practices and policies that increase faculty diversity.” • 48.79% of faculty and staff agree, “My dental school/allied dental education program has effective hiring practices and policies that increase <u>staff</u> diversity.” 	<p><u>U.S. Dental Schools</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase baseline to 60% of faculty and staff agree, “My dental school/allied dental education program has effective hiring practices and policies that increase faculty diversity.” • Increase baseline to 60% of faculty and staff agree, “My dental school/allied dental education program has effective hiring practices and policies that increase <u>staff</u> diversity.” <p><u>U.S. Allied Dental Education Programs</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase baseline to 67% of faculty and staff agree, “My dental school/allied dental education program has effective hiring practices and policies that increase faculty diversity.” • Increase baseline to 65% of faculty and staff agree, “My dental school/allied dental education program has effective hiring practices and policies that increase <u>staff</u> diversity.” <p><u>Canada</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase baseline to 57% of faculty and staff agree, “My dental school/allied dental education program has effective hiring practices and policies that increase faculty diversity.” • Increase baseline to 54% of faculty and staff agree, “My dental school/allied dental education program has effective hiring practices and policies that increase <u>staff</u> diversity.”

Equitable Policies & Practices

Key Implementation Activities & Strategies	Accountable Party	Campus Readiness Level (Emerging, Proficient and Advanced)	Recommended Execution Timeframe
<p><i>Note: The following key implementation activities and strategies are recommendations for your campus to consider when working towards the outlined goal. The accountable party will vary from campus to campus and should be assigned to an individual, department, committee, etc., to track progress. What gets measured gets done! The campus readiness level was designed to help campuses determine what key implementation strategies align with their current state. We recommend taking the Meyer DEI Spectrum Tool to help gauge your current state. The Recommended Execution Timeframe is a recommendation and will vary from campus to campus and should be used as an exploratory timeframe for design and implementation.</i></p>			
Develop a Diversity, Equity, Inclusion and Belonging (DEIB) Committee with diverse representation that is charged with reviewing policies, developing a communication plan for disseminating changes, and assisting with the execution and advisement of DEIB initiatives.		Emerging	6 months
Conduct annual tailored implicit bias training for all students, faculty, staff and administrators.		Emerging	Ongoing (6-9 months for first training)
Communicate policies with all stakeholder groups annually. Ensure policies and procedures are easily accessible to all stakeholders and include reporting structures. Review during orientation or onboarding.		Emerging	Ongoing (3 months for first communication)
Committee review of all policies for students, faculty and staff using an equity lens to determine if bias and inequities exist. Areas of focus may include specific policies assessed in the climate study, recruitment, selection, admissions, promotions, tenure, evaluations, coursework, patient care, etc.:		Proficient	9-12 months
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Revise policies to ensure equity is centered. 		Proficient	6-12 months
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review and enhance all hiring practices and policies that increase staff diversity with a DEI lens so biases and inequities do not exist. 		Proficient	6 months
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review and enhance all admissions practices and policies that increase student diversity with a DEI lens so biases and inequities do not exist. 		Proficient	9 months
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Benchmark best practices with peer institutions (i.e., public dental schools of similar size and resources). 		Proficient	6-9 months
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Enhance anti-harassment/anti-bullying policies and investigation procedures to hold all stakeholders accountable for thorough and timely investigations that result in action or a summary report of why no action was taken. 		Advanced	9 months

Key Implementation Activities & Strategies	Accountable Party	Campus Readiness Level (Emerging, Proficient and Advanced)	Recommended Execution Timeframe
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review and enhance all hiring practices and policies that increase faculty diversity with a DEI lens so biases and inequities do not exist. 		Advanced	6 months

Area of Focus	Bias & Discrimination – Take Action Pledge
Goal #3	<p>Dental Schools and Allied Dental Education Programs participating in the ADEA Climate Study Take-Action Pledge will further create a humanistic environment that will focus on eliminating bias and discrimination within academic dentistry.</p> <p>The goal of 50% of U.S. and Canadian dental schools and allied dental education programs will participate over the next three years. Participating campuses will work to advance two or more of the commitments outlined in the pledge and track progress.</p>

2022 Baseline Indicators & Measurements	Impact Targets for Dental Education
<p><u>U.S. Dental Schools</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 17% of participants experienced discrimination. 27% of participants witnessed discrimination. <p><u>U.S. Allied Dental Education Programs</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 6% of participants experienced discrimination. 27% of participants witnessed discrimination. <p><u>Canada</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 17% of participants experienced discrimination. 27% of participants witnessed discrimination. 	<p>Decrease or maintain the percentage of students, faculty, staff and administrators who reported that they have experienced <u>bias or inequities</u> to:</p> <p><u>U.S. Dental Schools</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 12% of participants experienced discrimination. 22% of participants witnessed discrimination. <p><u>U.S. Allied Dental Education Programs</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 6% or less of participants experienced discrimination. 22% of participants witnessed discrimination. <p><u>Canada</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 12% of participants experienced discrimination. 22% of participants witnessed discrimination.
<p><u>U.S. Dental Schools</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 13% of participants experienced harassment. 20% of participants witnessed harassment. <p><u>U.S. Allied Dental Education Programs</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 6% of participants experienced harassment. 9% of participants witnessed harassment. <p><u>Canada</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 17% of participants experienced harassment. 24% of participants witnessed harassment. 	<p><u>U.S. Dental Schools</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 8% of participants experienced harassment. 15% of participants witnessed harassment. <p><u>U.S. Allied Dental Education Programs</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 6% of participants experienced harassment. 9% of participants witnessed harassment. <p><u>Canada</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 12% of participants experienced harassment. 19% of participants witnessed harassment.
<p>Of those who <u>experienced harassment or discrimination</u>, these participants reported it to their school or program</p> <p><u>U.S. Dental Schools</u></p>	<p>Of those who <u>experienced harassment or discrimination</u>, these participants reported it to their school or program</p> <p><u>U.S. Dental Schools</u></p>

- 34% of participants reported
- 32% of those who reported felt they received support

U.S. Allied Dental Education Programs

- 38% of participants reported
- 36% of those who reported felt they received support

Canada

- 42% of participants reported
- 40% of those who reported felt they received support

- 29% of participants reported
- 27% of those who reported felt they received support

U.S. Allied Dental Education Programs

- 33% of participants reported
- 31% of those who reported felt they received support

Canada

- 37% of participants reported
- 35% of those who reported felt they received support

Bias & Discrimination – Take Action Pledge

Commitment	Key Implementation Activities & Strategies	Accountable Party	Campus Readiness Level (Emerging, Proficient and Advanced)	Recommended Execution Timeframe
<p><i>Note: The following key implementation activities and strategies are recommendations for your campus to consider when working towards the outlined goal. The accountable party will vary from campus to campus and should be assigned to an individual, department, committee, etc., to track progress. What gets measured gets done! The campus readiness level was designed to help campuses determine what key implementation strategies align with their current state. We recommend taking the Meyer DEI Spectrum Tool to help gauge your current state. The Recommended Execution Timeframe is a recommendation and will vary from campus to campus and should be used as an exploratory timeframe for design and implementation.</i></p>				
1. Policy & Curriculum Review or Development	1.1 Incorporate education and practices focusing on bias and discrimination into coursework that focuses on patient-centered care.		Emerging	9-12 months
	1.2 Communicate policies with all stakeholder groups annually. Ensure that policies and procedures are easily accessible to all stakeholders. Review policies during orientation or onboarding.		Emerging	Ongoing (3 months for first communication)
	1.3 Benchmark best practices with peer institutions (i.e., public dental schools of similar size and resources).		Emerging	6-9 months
	1.4 Have committee review all policies for students, faculty and staff using an equity lens to determine if bias and inequities exist. Areas of focus may include recruitment, selection, admissions, promotions, tenure, evaluations, coursework, patient care, etc.		Proficient	9-12 months
	1.5 Revise policies to ensure equity is centered.		Proficient	6-12 months
	1.6 Have committee review the curriculum using an equity lens to ensure diversity, equity, inclusion and belonging (DEIB) best practices are incorporated.		Proficient	9-12 months
	1.7 Ensure your curriculum represents diverse histories, cultures, experiences and voices.		Proficient/Advanced	9-12 months
	1.8 Encourage scholarship that focuses on eliminating bias and discrimination within dental education.		Advanced	3-6 months

Commitment	Key Implementation Activities & Strategies	Accountable Party	Campus Readiness Level (Emerging, Proficient and Advanced)	Recommended Execution Timeframe
2. Implicit Bias Training	2.1 Conduct annual, tailored implicit bias training for all students, faculty, staff and administrators.		Emerging	Ongoing (6-9 months for first training)
	2.2 Provide education on cultural humility, stereotyping, forms of harassment and microaggressions.		Emerging	6 months
	2.3 Implement a process for all constituents to take the Harvard Implicit Association Test and discuss results within peer groups.		Emerging	6 months
3. Reporting Processes and Mechanisms	3.1 Develop or re-evaluate your reporting process for bias and discrimination.		Emerging	3-6 months
	3.2 Provide various reporting structures and contact information for multiple individuals who can assist with reporting.		Emerging	3-6 months
	3.3 Ensure all faculty, staff, and administrators understand state and federal-mandated reporting processes.		Emerging	Immediately
	3.4 Ensure all students, faculty, staff and administrators are aware of the policies, procedures, support structures, etc. Consider having each community member sign an agreement of understanding.		Emerging	3 months
	3.5 Train multiple faculty, staff and administrators on supporting students or peers throughout the reporting process.		Emerging	6 months
	3.6 Develop a structure on how to report instances of bias and discrimination. Provide an F.A.Q. Send to all stakeholders annually and review during orientation or onboarding.		Proficient	6-9 months
4. Bystander Intervention Practices	4.1 Provide annual training on different types of discrimination not limited to race, gender, religion, sexual orientation, age, disability, etc. Include best practices and scenarios to illustrate the importance of bystander intervention.		Emerging	Ongoing (3-6 months for first training)

Commitment	Key Implementation Activities & Strategies	Accountable Party	Campus Readiness Level (Emerging, Proficient and Advanced)	Recommended Execution Timeframe
5. Support Systems and Structures	5.1 Encourage and support students of color and other historically marginalized groups to create programs and organizations that ensure they feel supported within dental education.		Emerging	6-9 months
	5.2 Support individuals who experience bias and discrimination by ensuring that their experiences are validated and providing access to counseling and mental health services to process the emotional impact.		Emerging	6 months
	5.3 Develop affinity groups or employee resource groups.		Proficient	3 months
6. Resources	6.1 Develop and communicate a list of institutional and outside resources available to students, faculty, staff and administrators when navigating reporting structures. (i.e., mental health resources, policies, how to report, etc.)		Emerging	3 months
7. Accountability	7.1 Develop clear policies reinforcing that no retaliation or retribution will occur during or after reporting incidents, and accountability will be taken.		Emerging	3 months
	7.2 Develop a campus-level pledge that students, faculty, staff and administrators can affirm their commitment to addressing bias and discrimination at an individual and system level.		Emerging	6 months
	7.3 Develop a policy that ensures that all reported incidents are investigated, appropriate action is taken and follow-up occurs.		Emerging	3 months
	7.4 Provide learning opportunities for individuals who commit acts of bias that focus on awareness, knowledge, skills, personal reflection, etc.		Proficient	4 months
	7.5 Define accountability for your campus and communicate it.		Proficient	4 months
	7.6 Establish an Anti-bias Committee to support and assist with the execution of campus initiatives.		Proficient	2 months
	7.7 Develop an institutional action statement that includes community standards and action steps that will be taken when issues arise to ensure collective responsibility.		Advanced	3 months

8. Bias Reduction Strategies	8.1 Education and awareness: Increasing awareness of different types of biases.		Emerging	Ongoing (3-6 months for initial set-up)
	8.2 Challenge stereotypes: Challenge stereotypes and address misinformation when encountered in everyday conversations or interactions.		Emerging	Ongoing (3-6 months for initial set-up)
	8.3 Feedback mechanisms: Encourage open and constructive feedback. Share multiple information-gathering tools.		Emerging	Ongoing (3-6 months for initial set-up)
	8.4 Inclusive language: Use inclusive language and avoid stereotypes in communication to create a more welcoming environment for all.		Emerging	Ongoing (3-6 months for initial set-up)
	8.5 Institutional policies: Establish and enforce policies against discrimination and bias.		Emerging	Ongoing (3-6 months for initial set-up)
	8.6 Anonymous/non-identifiable recruitment: In recruitment processes, use anonymous hiring techniques to remove identifiable information such as names, gender or age from resumes.		Proficient	3 months
	8.7 Diverse representation: Ensure diversity and representation in decision-making bodies, committees and teams.		Proficient	3 months
	8.8 Collaborative decision-making: Adopt an inclusive decision-making model. Involve multiple stakeholders in decision-making processes to prevent individual biases from dominating the outcome. Rely on data- and evidence-based approaches in decision-making rather than personal opinions or assumptions.		Advanced	6 months (create & adopt); 9-12 months (training & execution)
	8.9 Peer review and validation: In research and academic settings, use peer review and validation processes to ensure objectivity and reduce biases in study design and interpretation.		Advanced	Ongoing (6 months for initial set-up)
9. Collecting and Utilizing Trend Data	9.1 Use surveys and other data collection processes to evaluate and monitor experiences and progress on your commitment consistently.		Proficient	Ongoing (3-6 months for initial set-up)
	9.2 Collect data on social identities and roles. Track reporting based on social identities and roles to determine trends that require action. Additional areas to consider trend data: applications, retention, etc.		Advanced	Ongoing (3-6 months for initial set-up)

	9.3 Develop a Bias Annual Report (https://inclusive.princeton.edu/about/reports-webinars/bias-annual-report)		Advanced	9-12 months
10. Building Trust	10.1 Focus on effective communication practices. Set communication practices that include open, honest and timely communication.		Emerging	5 months
	10.2 Team-building activities: Organize activities that promote collaboration, identity exploration, understanding and a sense of belonging.		Emerging	6 months
	10.3 Recognize and celebrate the contributions of individuals and stakeholder groups working to advance DEIB initiatives at your campus.		Emerging	6 months
	10.4 Be transparent with goals and actions. Clearly communicate your campus DEIB goals, objectives and expectations. Share data findings, action steps and success metrics.		Emerging	3 months
	10.5 Collect stakeholder group feedback on DEIB and biases, which may include one-on-one meetings, 360-degree evaluations, course evaluation forms, anonymous surveys, external audits, exit surveys, etc.		Proficient	Ongoing (3-6 months for initial set-up)

Area of Focus	ADEA Support of Campuses Actively Working to Advance a Humanistic Environment within Dental Education
Goal #4	ADEA will support participating campuses by investing in data collection and assessment processes, identifying and deploying resources, and providing educational opportunities to further diversity, equity, inclusion and belonging (DEIB) within dental education.

ADEA Support of Campuses Actively Working to Advance a Humanistic Environment Within Dental Education

Key Implementation Activities & Strategies	Accountable Party	Timeline
Continue to provide educational opportunities to further DEIB awareness, knowledge and skills.	ADEA / Access, Diversity and Inclusion	Continuously over the next 3 years.
Development of DEIB-related support resources that can be used for action planning and tracking success.	ADEA / Access, Diversity and Inclusion	Continuously over the next 3 years.
Provide quarterly opportunities for dental education leaders to meet to share best practices.	ADEA / Access, Diversity and Inclusion	Continuously over the next 3 years.
Collect campus-level data to track success for benchmarking and sharing of best practices being implemented at the campus level.	ADEA / Access, Diversity and Inclusion	Continuously over the next 3 years.
Serve as a thought partner to campuses seeking guidance to advance DEIB.	ADEA / Access, Diversity and Inclusion	Continuously over the next 3 years.
The ADEA Board of Directors will continue to support the ADEA Climate Study initiatives as a priority that will help dental schools and allied dental education programs meet their CODA accreditation standard of a humanistic environment while advancing DEIB for Member Institutions.	ADEA Board of Directors	Continuously over the next 3 years.
Provide sample diversity goals that campuses can adopt at the campus level to provide alignment of tactical goals within departments, programs and classrooms.	ADEA CDECA	Continuously over the next 3 years.

Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Spectrum Tool



Meyer created the Diversity, Equity and Inclusion (DEI) Spectrum Tool to help organizations assess where they are on their DEI journey and to identify potential areas for future work.

It is also intended to provide shared language to help Meyer staff and nonprofits talk together about what DEI currently looks like in an applicant's organization and opportunities for growth.

To develop this tool, Meyer convened a small committee of staff members who reviewed numerous assessments, both elaborate and simple.

"Our goal was to create a multi-dimensional tool that reflects the complex ways that diversity, equity and inclusion are expressed in organizations," said Kris Smock, a consultant who worked with us on the tool.

Meyer's own journey toward diversity, equity and inclusion required us to understand and

assess the areas where improvements were and continue to be needed. We ask all our grantees to do the same: to explore equity within the context of their organizations and make progress on integrating equity in their work, partnerships, outreach, policies, staff and boards.

Our goal is to talk with, not judge, organizations about where they are in the spectrum as a baseline for growth and to recognize where their current strengths and opportunities lie.

Although there's no one right approach, we suggest that organizations ask themselves where they think they are on the spectrum in each of the 12 areas listed in the tool. Don't be surprised when you discover that individuals on

your team have different perspectives on where you land in certain areas or when your constituents point to something that you had not yet considered. Don't shy away from this complexity. Instead, dig in and use it as an opportunity to deepen your collective understanding of DEI and how it relates to your organization's mission and how you operate.

Carol Cheney
DEI Manager

Jill Fuglister
Healthy Environment Portfolio Director

Matt Morton
Equitable Education Portfolio Director

REPRINTING & ADAPTATION

Since this tool was created, we've been glad to hear that it has been helpful to so many individuals and organizations. If you'd like to reprint or adapt this content, we simply ask that you include a credit to Meyer Memorial Trust.

INSTRUCTIONS:

On the following pages, use this assessment tool to self-assess where you believe your dental school or allied dental education program is on the spectrum scale for each of the 12 categories. Below each category is a purple box, place an **X** that corresponds with your assessment.

This scale has been adapted to align with the following categories: emerging, proficient and advanced. While each goal may vary, this scale may be a good indicator to key implementation activities your campus should explore first.

Diversity, Equity and Inclusion (DEI) Spectrum Tool



DEI Component	Not Yet Started	Ready to Start	Launched	Well on the Way	Exemplary or Leading
DEI Vision	Does not see DEI as relevant to its work	Recognizes the importance of DEI to its work and is contemplating its next steps	Recognizes the importance of DEI to its work and is in the process of developing a shared DEI vision	Has developed a shared DEI vision and is working to align the organization's programs and operations with this vision	Has integrated DEI in organizational mission and vision statements which are actively being used to guide the organization's programs and operations
Commitment	Does not have an interest in advancing its DEI work	Is interested in advancing its DEI work and is considering how to do so	Is interested in advancing its DEI work and has put some strategies or actions in motion	actively engages in advancing its DEI work	A commitment to DEI is fully institutionalized throughout the organization, both internally and externally
Leadership	Members of management, staff or board have not taken leadership on DEI issues	A few members of management, staff or board are leading the DEI discussion	A DEI point person or team is leading the organization's DEI work	All levels of management, staff and board are taking leadership on DEI issues	Organization is a DEI leader and is helping to build the field and best practices; leadership demonstrates accountability to clients, constituents and stakeholders
Policies	Does not have any DEI-related organizational policies (<i>beyond non-discrimination policies</i>)	Does not have but is interested in developing DEI-related organizational policies (<i>beyond non-discrimination policies</i>)	May have some DEI-related language in some of its organizational policies	Has DEI policies and/or organizational DEI plan but may be unclear about how to operationalize it	Has DEI policies and an organizational DEI plan with clear goals, strategies and indicators of progress

Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Spectrum Tool



DEI Component	Not Yet Started	Ready to Start	Launched	Well on the Way	Exemplary or Leading
Infrastructure	Has not had internal discussions about the organization's DEI work	Has had some internal DEI discussions but doesn't have an infrastructure to guide the organization's DEI work	Individuals or small groups are guiding internal DEI discussions but aren't integrated into the organization as a whole	Has internal committees, affinity groups or other formal structures focused on integrating DEI issues into the organization's work	Work on DEI issues is integrated into every aspect of organizational culture and infrastructure
Training	Has not done any training related to DEI	Is contemplating doing organizational DEI training; individual staff may have done some initial training	Some staff or board have participated in DEI-related training	All management, staff and board are involved in DEI training and capacity building	Fosters ongoing DEI training, growth and leadership among management, staff and board in line with an equity plan/strategy; staff are held accountable to DEI-related practices
Diversity	Doesn't see diversification of board and staff as a priority; may be paralyzed by the perceived challenges or view it as unattainable	Has had initial discussions about and values the idea of diversifying its board and staff	Beginning attempts to diversify its board and/or staff but may not know how to do it effectively or have strategies and systems in place; may not result in growing diversity	Actively works to increase diversity of board and staff, resulting in growing diversity; has begun to identify and institute retention strategies for diverse staff	Has policies and strategies for strengthening and maintaining organizational diversity; staff and board represent the diversity of the community it serves; effective retention strategies are implemented

Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Spectrum Tool



DEI Component	Not Yet Started	Ready to Start	Launched	Well on the Way	Exemplary or Leading
Data	Does not collect demographic data in its programmatic or operational work	Does not collect demographic data in its programmatic or operational work, but views this as a future goal	Collects some demographic data in its programmatic or operational work, but not in a systematic or comprehensive way	Collects and disaggregates comprehensive demographic data in its programmatic and operational work but may not know what to do with the information	Routinely collects, disaggregates and analyzes demographic data for all programmatic and operational work; uses the information in planning and decision-making
Community	Doesn't express interest in building stronger partnerships with communities facing disparities; may see it as unrealistic or unimportant to the organization's mission	Values the idea of building partnerships with communities facing disparities, but may not know how or have relationships to draw upon	Beginning to build partnerships with communities facing disparities but has not yet established accountability to or meaningful partnerships with these communities; may approach it in a tokenistic way	Actively works to build partnerships and trust with communities facing disparities; working to understand how to provide value and support to these communities	Has strong, mutually beneficial, accountable and equitable partnerships with diverse organizations and leaders from communities facing disparities
Decisions	DEI considerations do not factor into decision-making	Interested in factoring DEI considerations into decision-making, but may view it as an option or an add-on to core decisionmaking considerations	Decisions are occasionally influenced by DEI considerations in an ad hoc way	Decisions regarding organizational policies, practices and resource allocation are informed by DEI considerations	Decisions regarding organizational policies, practices and resource allocation are systematically guided by DEI considerations

Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Spectrum Tool



DEI Component	Not Yet Started	Ready to Start	Launched	Well on the Way	Exemplary or Leading
Accountability	DEI-related metrics are not included in evaluations of staff or programs or in organizational accountability mechanisms	May recognize the value of including DEI-related metrics in evaluations of staff or programs or in organizational accountability mechanisms, but has not made any plans to do so	Is preparing to include or is currently including DEI-related metrics in a few aspects of the organization, such as staff and/or board representation or evaluations of specific projects	Some of the organization's standard evaluation and accountability mechanisms include DEI-related metrics	All evaluation and accountability mechanisms for the organization, its projects, programs, management, staff and board include specific DEI-related metrics
Inclusion	No explicit effort is made to create an inclusive atmosphere for staff and board members from communities facing disparities	Values the idea of being an inclusive organization but tries to achieve this by encouraging staff and board members from communities facing disparities to participate in the dominant culture	There is an appreciation of the voice and perspective of staff and board members from communities facing disparities, particularly in relation to the organization's DEI work, but they are still expected to conform to the dominant culture	The voice of staff and board members from communities facing disparities is valued and is integrated into aspects of the organization; the organization is in transition from a dominant culture to an inclusive/multicultural culture	All staff and board feel valued, and all aspects of the organization reflect the voice, contributions and interests of a multicultural constituency; the organization has transitioned to an inclusive/multicultural culture and has created systems, policies and practices to maintain this culture

Based on your self-assessment, where are most of your X's on the scale?

▪

Reflections and notes from this assessment.

▪
▪
▪

Not Yet
Started

Ready to
Start

Launched

Well on
the Way

Exemplary
or Leading

Emerging

Proficient

Advanced

Sample Campus-level Goal Setting

Campuses are encouraged to tailor and adapt the overarching ADEA Climate Study-related goals to their respective campuses. Below is a grid that campuses can use to incorporate their campus-level data to develop their action plans further.

Goal #X	
Objectives	

Key Implementation Activities/ Strategies	Accountable Party	Deliverables/ Outputs	Baseline Measurement	Impact Target	Timeline	Resources Needed	Potential Barriers	Instances for Integration

Resource Assessment	Overall, list any additional resources (people, time, financial, infrastructure, etc.) required to achieve this goal.	
----------------------------	---	--