

Appendix D

Revision date – 12.12.18

Provided courtesy of the Duke University School of Medicine. It was developed by the Duke University School of Medicine's Inclusion Council, an inter-professional group of faculty, staff and learners representing the departments, institutes and centers within the School of Medicine.

DIVERSITY RECRUITMENT TOOLKIT

The Duke School of Medicine's Recruitment and Retention Working Group developed this Diversity Recruitment toolkit from a variety of sources. We encourage members to use and share this information freely as they develop their own strategies to achieve excellence through diversity.

ODI RECRUITMENT CHECKLIST

Successful inclusive search processes require planning, patience, and intentionality. Once a faculty or staff position becomes available for recruitment, it is imperative for Department leaders and the potential search committee chair(s) to create processes that are transparent, timely, and effective. Please click on the following link to review a Recruitment checklist that is a summary of best practices within diversity & inclusion and can be used to organize an efficient and inclusive search process.

Department/Division/Administrative Entity

- Review recruitment procedures, modify as necessary, and implement improved changes
- If available, review relevant survey or exit interview data to identify areas for improvement within climate or entity culture that may have impact on retention

Search Committee / Interview Team

- Determine search committee chair(s)
- Define number of committee members
- Identify committee members and request participation
- Communicate search committee membership and members to department/center/institute
- Review recruitment process and distribute relevant materials
- Complete training in implicit/unconscious bias

Search Plan Development

- Establish milestones and timelines for search process
- Complete job summary/description
- Develop objective criteria used for candidate evaluation
- Identify candidate sourcing strategies

Sourcing and Building a Diverse Candidate Pool

- Implement advertising strategies
- Implement networking strategies

Candidate Selection and Interview Process

- Review and evaluate applications
- Identify candidates to be interviewed
- Initiate interview process
- Develop "short list" of top candidates

Selecting Candidate for Hire

- Evaluate interview feedback and disqualify “short list” candidates based on pre-determined objective criteria
- Identify primary candidate for hire
- Assess reasons for eliminating other candidates

Process Review

- Assess effectiveness of process and recommend changes for future recruitment
- Communicate results of committee search
- Communicate/share note of thanks to committee membership

CRITICAL POINTS IN THE SEARCH PROCESS

The following information and links will provide you with specific tips and best practices for all stages of the search process. At the end of each section, there is also a link to the Duke Office of Institutional Equity’s Faculty and Staff Recruitment and Hiring guide. We suggest you use these links in conjunction with the ODI Recruitment Checklist when planning your search process.

1. Establishing the Search Committee/Interview Team

Click below for some tips and best practices for creating an effective, diverse committee of representatives that ensures inclusion of different perspectives, fairness in decision-making, and greater success in hiring and retention of diverse faculty and staff.

- ◆ Define minimum number of search committee members and ensure that the search committee consists of diverse members of the department or recruiting unit including a broad spectrum of diversity (ethnicity, race, gender, sexual orientation, staff/faculty roles, etc.: if appropriate, include others as ex officio committee members)
- ◆ Involve people from outside the hiring department, who are committed to reducing bias, on the search committee or as “trainers” to assist committee members in recognizing hidden bias as it relates to hiring decisions. (upenn.edu, 2016)
- ◆ Increase accountability for those who make hiring decisions (upenn.edu, 2016)
- ◆ Provide information (handouts, manual, guidelines) as resource for faculty search committees to review the requirements prior to beginning of search
- ◆ Training for search committees in implicit/unconscious bias – talk by Judy Seidenstein on “Strategies for a Broad & Inclusive Search Process: Insuring Excellence” (DIC Wiki site)
- ◆ Engage search committee members in critical conversations about unconscious bias prior to search
- ◆ Request individuals involved in hiring to take the online version of the IAT (<https://implicit.harvard.edu/>)
- ◆ Discuss the role of subtle and unintentional bias: potential for subtle and unintended bias as it relates to gender, race, presentation style, accent, dress, weight.
- ◆ Review *Diversity Leadership Interview Q’s* for applicants regarding experience in supporting diverse environments
- ◆ Targeted training for faculty to meet needs of lab staff/research staff, fellows/residents/postdocs/ students – utilize Duke Office of Diversity & Inclusion and Office for Institutional Equity for training resources (see Implicit /Unconscious Bias Resource section and Additional Diversity Recruitment Resource section.
- ◆ Conduct mid-process review to evaluate effectiveness of search committee process

- ◆ Entrance/exit surveys – conduct questionnaires to assess effectiveness of strategies used in search process
- ◆ Appoint a diversity advocate on each search committee to raise awareness of potential bias in committee discussion
- ◆ Include representatives from campus groups on search committee (i.e. Black Faculty Caucus, Senior Women in Natural Sciences)
- ◆ Involve graduate and professional students in faculty recruitment

Please click the below links for other resources from the Duke Office of Institutional Equity which includes additional tips and best practices for both faculty and staff search committee formation.

OIE Resource: Faculty: Formation of Search Committee

OIE Resource: Staff: Formation of Search Committee

2. Search Plan Development

This is a critical stage in the search process and consider the following when creating position descriptions for faculty and staff that do not infer bias, but insure hiring teams target and attract the most qualified diverse talent, maximize equity in hiring decisions, and assess individuals to identify those who value and embrace team and workplace diversity.

- ◆ Make hiring process more transparent (upenn.edu, 2016)
- ◆ Determine process for reviewing applicant CVs
- ◆ Identify candidate sourcing avenues/strategies
- ◆ Develop objective criteria used for candidate evaluation ; only use limited subjective criteria as appropriate and unbiased
- ◆ Delineate qualities of “ideal candidate” and necessary qualifications: Background and training
 - a. Create an outcome framework listing key characteristics with notation of suitable substitutes or allowable similarities
- ◆ Set minimum number of candidates to be interviewed prior to beginning interview process
- ◆ Establish milestones and timelines for search process
- ◆ Develop advertisement template for search committees to use as a model for their posting
- ◆ Complete job summary/description

Please click the below links for other resources from the Duke Office of Institutional Equity which includes additional tips and best practices for creating faculty and staff position descriptions.

OIE Resource: Faculty: Position Descriptions

OIE Resource: Staff: Position Descriptions

3. Sourcing and Building a Diverse Candidate Pool

The “pool” or lack of underrepresented candidates within the “pool” are often cited reasons why diversity efforts are not successful. The reality, however, is that search leaders rarely are intentional about the candidate pool and generally rely on existing networks which were not broad enough to capture the candidates to diversify the “pool.” Leaders should be creative and intentional. The below bullet points include talent acquisition strategies designed to broaden and diversify the candidate pool.

- ◆ Include stated institutional commitment to diversity and inclusion in advertisements

- ◆ Utilize gender-neutral language in advertisements
- ◆ Diversify the applicant pool through the use of electronic job-posting services, websites, listservs, journals, publications, particularly targeted at diverse groups such as minority and women’s caucuses or professional networks. Leverage enhanced recruitment sources such as LGBTQ+ sites and URM professional sites e.g., SACNAS, NOBCChE, AISES, MinorityPostdoc.org , and ABRCMS.
- ◆ Establish and leverage ties with HBCUs
- ◆ Maintain contacts with outstanding URM and women students as they advance through graduate and postdoctoral studies or medical school and residency, and then into positions for faculty recruitment. Track Duke graduates and maintain lists (Alumni, Mellon Fellows, etc.
- ◆ Consider cluster hiring, utilize interdisciplinary hiring; use targeted searches in areas where there are more potential candidates
- ◆ Conduct open searches to avoid narrow field that limits women and URM applicants
- ◆ Be open to all sourcing avenues: industry, government, business, private practice
- ◆ Collaborate and work with consortium of peer schools to enhance pool of URMs
- ◆ Foster pipeline development via high school students, former Duke students, students from HBCUs, postdocs
- ◆ Collaborate on faculty hires (i.e. partnership hires)
- ◆ Utilize conferences to bring URMs to campus
- ◆ Evaluate speakers as potential faculty candidates
- ◆ Identify creative ways in how and where to seek talent, going beyond the usual places and “casting a wide net” to reach out to URM and women candidates who might not come forward on their own.
- ◆ Expand and utilize pipeline programs to enrich the applicant pool for college, medical school, residency and fellowship training, and faculty positions. These programs include:
 - Building Overtures & Opportunities in Science & Technology (BOOST)
 - Summer Medical and Dental Education Program (SMDEP)
 - Summer Research Opportunities Program (SROP)
 - Initiative for Maximizing Student Development (IMSD)
 - Duke Biosciences Collaborative for Research Engagement (Duke BioCoRE)
 - The Visiting Clinical Scholars

Please click the below links for other resources from the Duke Office of Institutional Equity which includes additional tips and best practices for diversifying the candidate pool.

[OIE Resource: Faculty: Strategies to Build a Diverse Pool](#)

[OIE Resource Staff: Strategies to Build a Diverse Pool](#)

4. Candidate Selection and Interview Process

Once the search committee and leaders have completed the necessary steps to create the foundation of an inclusive and broad candidate search, the work of candidate selection can begin. Committees that begin interviewing candidates without a clear framework or consistently applied guidelines and questions risk introducing bias in the search process. It is critical that members are reminded of bias potential at this stage and leaders work to standardize processes and limit subjectivity. See below for some specific suggestions and tips to better ensure that a broad range of opinions are solicited and considered in the selection criteria and decision.

- ◆ Review applications with diversity and inclusion in mind (where possible, exclude information

that could lead to bias)

- ◆ Be aware of subtle and unintended bias when reviewing CVs (educational institution, location of prior employment, type of experience, gender, etc.)
- ◆ Identify a list of core questions to be asked of all candidates; questions should be related to the job description
- ◆ Ensure search committee is aware of illegal questions
- ◆ Interview process should be the same for all candidates
- ◆ Consider that cultural differences can affect first impressions of candidates. For instance, the standard interview in the United States uses the criteria of self-confidence, goal orientation enthusiasm, and leadership even though these qualities may not be apparent in people of more reserved cultures
- ◆ Reserve ample time for interviews and evaluations as bias emerges more when evaluators are limited by time pressure
- ◆ Ensure diverse candidates have opportunity to engage with other diverse individuals during the interview process
- ◆ Provide opportunities for candidates to engage with diverse faculty or leadership on their interview day, either as interviewer, over lunch/dinner, etc.
- ◆ Ask applicants what diversity and inclusion means to them
- ◆ Encourage candidates to speak about their views on diversity and inclusion, including their plans for implementing diversity and inclusion in the workplace
- ◆ Ask applicants for statement on diversity and inclusion (faculty searches)*
- ◆ Request applicant statement describing previous experiences and/or future goals in mentoring and fostering diversity in science
- ◆ Look beyond academic excellence in making shortlists of successful candidates for qualities such as the ability to interact with diverse colleagues/trainees/students, mentoring abilities, and experiences gained from non-traditional career paths
- ◆ Emphasize enhanced culture of safety in surrounding community
- ◆ Highlight policies that support family needs and work/life balance (e.g., parental leave, extended time to tenure, flexible work options, etc.)
- ◆ Support a systematic mentoring program and share the strength of the mentoring program with candidates
- ◆ Discuss opportunities to enhance career in traditional and non-traditional ways
- ◆ Emphasize support for dual career transitions
- ◆ Emphasize opportunities to support work/life balance
- ◆ Emphasize competitive salary and adequate time to do research
- ◆ Respect candidate's privacy, avoid personal question

*Wording of requested statement or questions selected by department/division/administrative unit as appropriate to assess applicant's sensitivity to diversity and inclusion issues

Please click the below links for other resources from the Duke Office of Institutional Equity which includes additional tips and best practices for selecting candidates for interview.

[OIE Resource: Faculty: Selecting Candidates to Interview](#)

[OIE Resource: Staff: Selecting Candidates to Interview](#)

5. Selecting Candidate for Hire

Once candidates have been interviewed, the committee will need to evaluate each potential hire and determine who will be offered the position. The search committee will either make a recommendation or provide the summary of the candidate evaluations to the department/center/institute chair. As stated previously, reminding committee members about the potential for “bias creep” will be extremely important. Members should also make sure to review the suggested ideal candidate criteria and specifically avoid language and discussions related to “fit”. Members may need to recuse themselves or decline to participate in certain discussions if there are conflicts or personal relationships. The search committee chair will also need to work to ensure he/she manages his/her potential influence on search committee members related to power dynamics within the group.

- ◆ Evaluate interview feedback and disqualify candidates based on pre-determined objective criteria
- ◆ Develop “short list” and assess reasons for eliminating other candidates
- ◆ Hire those whom we expect to promote and retain
- ◆ Avoid excessive selection factors or hiring expectations that can unconsciously restrict the number of accepted diversity applicants (i.e., requiring excessive years of experience, medical school they attended, grade-point average etc.
- ◆ Be cognizant that recommenders may hold unconscious bias

6. Process Review

This is an often missed opportunity to improve upon the search process for future hires. Search committee chairs or department leadership should consider gathering qualitative and/or quantitative feedback on the process itself and then consider sharing this with department/center/institute members. It will also be important at this stage to acknowledge the search committee and chair broadly, thereby providing recognition for their service to the department/center/institute.

- ◆ Consider creating a formal evaluation of the search committee process and/or chair. Share this information with search committee members.
- ◆ Send a message of thanks and the outcome of the search process.
- ◆ Assess the effectiveness of the search process and recommend any improvements for future recruitment
- ◆ Track hiring patterns and identify the ones who have a low and high diversity hiring success rate. Leverage the activities of the high success rate manager to coach and guide managers with lower success rates.

ADVERTISING AND NETWORKING

The below section includes a variety of resources, organizations, and websites that can be used to create broad and inclusive searches. The resources are listed by various constituency or affinity groups.

Diversity Recruitment Resources

African Americans

<u>The Journal of Blacks in Higher Education</u>	<u>Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCU Connect)</u>
<u>National Society of Black Engineers</u>	<u>Minority Postdoc</u>
<u>National Organization for the Professional Advancement of Black Chemist and Chemical Engineers</u>	<u>National Medical association (an association of African-American physicians)</u>
<u>National Black MBA Association</u>	<u>National Society of Black Physicists</u>
<u>Association of Black Women Physicians</u>	<u>North Carolina Central University</u>
<u>NC A&T</u>	<u>Winston Salem State University</u>
<u>Spelman College</u>	
Asian Americans	
<u>National Association of Asian American Professionals</u>	
Individuals with Disabilities	
<u>Ability Jobs and Job Access</u>	<u>Job Opportunities for Disabled Veterans</u>
<u>Disabled Person Inc.</u>	<u>Getting Hired</u>
Diversity in the Workplace	
<u>Workplacediversity.com</u>	<u>Diversity : A World of Change</u>
<u>Insight into Diversity</u>	<u>Diversity Working</u>
<u>The PhD Project</u>	
Gay, Lesbian, Bisexual and Transgender	
<u>Gay and Lesbian Medical Association</u>	<u>National Organization of Gay and Lesbian Scientists and Technical Professionals</u>

<u>The National Consortium of Directors of LGBT Resources in Higher Education</u>	<u>Pro Gay Jobs</u>
Hispanic Americans	
<u>Society for Advancement Chicanos/Hispanics and Native Americans in Science</u>	<u>National Hispanic Medical Association</u>
<u>MAES Latinos in Science and Engineering</u>	<u>Association of Latino Professionals in Finance and Accounting</u>
<u>Hispanic Association for Colleges and Universities National Headquarters</u>	<u>National Society for Hispanic Professionals</u>
<u>National Society of Hispanic Physicists</u>	<u>Hispanic Outlook in Higher Education</u>
<u>Hispanic Network Magazine Online</u>	<u>Latinos in Higher Education</u>
<u>LatPro, Inc - Latinos in Higher Education</u>	<u>Society of Hispanic Professional Engineers</u>
Native Americans	
<u>American Indian Science and Engineering Society</u>	<u>Association of American Indian Physicians</u>
<u>Society for Advancement of Chicanos and Native Americans in Science</u>	
Women	
<u>American Physical Society: Committee on Status of Women in Physics</u>	<u>Women's Career Networking and Professional Associations</u>
<u>American Women's Society of Certified Public Accountants</u>	<u>Women in Higher Education</u>
<u>Association for Women in Computing</u>	<u>Women for Hire</u>
<u>Financial Women's Association</u>	<u>National Women's Studies Association</u>
<u>National Center for Women and Information Technology</u>	<u>Association for Women in Science</u>
Veterans	
<u>Military Hire</u>	<u>Veteran Employment</u>

Careers for Transitioning Military	Vet Jobs
Conferences	
Annual Biomedical Research Conference for Minority Students	Advancing Chicanos/Hispanics & Native Americans in Science

IMPLICIT / UNCONSCIOUS BIAS VIDEOS and RESOURCES

Resources that cover human bias, the implications of unconscious or implicit bias in the workplace, and ways to ensure processes for identifying, recruiting, and hiring talent are equitable.

Faculty: [Unpacking Implicit Bias](#) - OIE offers tips, strategies and resources that cover how to identify, address and prevent IB influences when recruiting and hiring faculty. This segment covers creating the candidate pool, preparing for and conducting the interview, and selecting candidate, and the interview process. Additional resources also provided.

Staff: [Unpacking Implicit Bias](#) - OIE provides tips and strategies to ensure equity in “staff” hiring and talent acquisition. Additional resources—articles, books and videos—included.

[Take the Implicit Bias Survey](#)

The Implicit Association Test (IAT) measures attitudes and beliefs that people may be unwilling or unable to report. The IAT may be especially interesting if it shows that you have an implicit attitude that you did not know about. You will have a choice of many different tests to take including but not limited to age, gender, sexuality, and race. After completing the test, you will receive an interpretation of your results.

[Implicit Association Test Discussion \(13 minutes\)](#)

Harvard Prof. Mahzarin Banaji on detecting the strength of associations, indirect measures of cognition, and how to find the truth about our mind. This explains some of the psychological principles behind the construct of the IAT.

[E-Learning Seminar: What You Don't Know: The Science of Unconscious Bias and What To Do About it in the Search and Recruitment Process](#)

[Exploring Unconscious Bias in Academic Medicine \(30 minutes\)](#)

This is a discussion with Howard Ross that normalizes implicit bias and provides some suggestions for how to mitigate its effects.

[Scientific American Frontiers: The Hidden Prejudice \(8 minutes\)](#)

Alan Alda, speaks with Dr. Mahzarin R. Banaji (Harvard University) and Dr. Brian Nosek (University of Virginia) on how the subconscious mind can influence decision making. They discuss several experiments that use the "Implicit Association Test" (IAT) to reveal hidden gender and racial biases.

[Ben Reese - “Identifying and Reducing Subtle Bias” \(8 minutes\)](#)

How to identify subtle bias in decision-making.

[Exposing Hidden Bias at Google](#)

This link is an article with an embedded training video that is accessible.

[What Facebook's Anti-Bias Training Program Gets Right
Facebook's Training Modules](#)

[University of California, San Francisco General Resources on Unconscious Bias](#)

ADDITIONAL DIVERSITY RECRUITMENT RESOURCES

[Duke University Office for Institutional Equity](#)

Provides a wealth of information, links, videos, recommended books, and its own “Diversity Toolkit.” This site can serve as a valuable resource for educating others in your department or work place about different aspects of diversity and inclusion.

[Report of the Faculty Diversity Task Force on Faculty Excellence through Diversity and Inclusion](#): Provides a comprehensive assessment of diversity practices at Duke University, including recommended practices for faculty hiring.

[Medical University of South Carolina Ten-Year Diversity Strategic Plan](#)

[2010 MIT Report on Faculty Diversity](#)

[OXIDE’S Diversity and Inclusion Presentation for Faculty Meetings](#)

[University of Michigan STRIDE Program Presentation on Recruiting and Retaining Diverse Faculty](#)



STRIDE
presentation.pdf

[Academic Council Task Force on Diversity: Dr. Boyce 2015 Task Force on Biosciences Diversity](#)



Boyce Task Force
Subcommittee Two

Diversity Leadership Interview Questions

Below are examples of ways to find out about an applicant's experience with supporting diverse environments, or her/his thinking about how to do so in a way that will be relevant to the functions of the role. Many of the questions are based on the principles of behavioral interviewing, which uses questions about specific past performance to predict future performance.

These samples include a range of questions that might be asked of people applying for all kinds of positions at an institution, with various levels of responsibility. Not every question is appropriate for every position. Please review the questions to see how they are designed and determine whether you find any that are particularly appropriate for the position you are filling.

1. How has your background and experience prepared you to be effective in an environment that holds diversity as core to our mission and values?

2. What does it mean for you to have a commitment to diversity? How have you demonstrated that commitment, and how would you see yourself demonstrating it here?
3. Suppose that you encounter a pervasive belief that diversity and excellence are somehow in conflict. How do you conceptualize the relationship between diversity and excellence? What kinds of leadership efforts would you undertake to encourage a commitment to excellence through diversity?
4. Describe the climate for diversity at your present position. What impact have you had on that climate?
5. What do you see as the most challenging aspects of an increasingly diverse academic medicine community, and what steps have you taken to meet such challenges?
6. What is your vision of diversity at an institution like Duke?
7. In your experience, what are the challenges faced by members of historically underrepresented groups in the workplace? What strategies have you used to address these challenges, and how successful were those strategies?
8. Have you encountered concerns about "chilly climate" raised by members of identity groups that have historically experienced discrimination? If so, how have you handled them?
9. Have you ever realized you had said or done something that may have been offensive to a colleague? How did you respond to that realization, and what was the outcome?
10. Tell me about a time that you adapted your style in order to work effectively with those who were different from you.
11. What kinds of experiences have you had in relating with people whose backgrounds are different than your own?
12. Can you recall a time when you gave feedback to a colleague who was not accepting of others?
13. Can you recall a time when a person's cultural background affected your approach to a work situation?
14. Give examples of times when your values and beliefs impacted your relationships with your colleagues.
15. Tell me about a time when you had to adapt to a wide variety of people by accepting/understanding their perspectives.
16. What measures have you taken to make someone feel comfortable when some people seemed uncomfortable with his or her presence?
17. What have you done to further your knowledge/understanding about diversity? How have you demonstrated your learning?
18. Tell us how you work with people to create or foster diversity in the workplace.
19. In what ways have you integrated multicultural issues as part of your professional development?
20. In what ways do you feel it is appropriate to incorporate topics related to diversity and (your discipline) into the medical curriculum? How would you do this?
21. Has diversity played a role in shaping your teaching and advising styles? If so, how?
22. Describe a specific situation in which you worked with a diverse group of people over a period of time. Based on this experience, what did you learn?
23. What efforts have you made, or been involved with, to foster cultural competence?

ATTRIBUTION: Adapted From: Oregon State University "Sample Interview Questions"

Resources for Faculty and Staff Recruitment and Retention

Faculty Data

Staff Data

Background

Answering the Question of the Year with Faculty Diversity

Faculty Development

FD4ME Faculty Development for Medical Educators

NIDDK Network of Minority Research Investigators (for tenure track faculty)

NIDDK Travel Awards for Residents and Fellows Attending the National Medical Association's (NMA) Annual Convention and Scientific Assembly – (Academic Career Development Program)

Recruitment and Retention

The Continued Evolution of Faculty Appointment and Tenure Policies at U.S. Medical Schools (Extended tenure clock policies)

What Makes Racial Diversity Work in Higher Education, Edited by Frank W. Hale, PhD, Stylus Publishing, LLC, 22883 Quicksilver Drive, Sterling, VA 20166

- Chapter 12: Diversification of the Faculty
- Chapter 15: Strategic Priorities and Strategic Funding – Minority Faculty at the University of Wisconsin-Madison 1988-2003

LITERATURE AND PUBLICATIONS

E-learning Seminar: What you Don't Know: The Science of Unconscious Bias and What to Do about it in the Search and Recruitment Process (AAMC seminar)

Answering the Question of the Year with Faculty Diversity

Leon McDougle, MD, MPH, Francis G. Lu, MD, and Ida L. Castro, JD, MA. (2011) *Answering the Question of the Year with Faculty Diversity. Academic Medicine*, Vol. 86, No. 11 / November 2011 p1344

Abstract

Academic health centers (AHCs) that embrace faculty diversity as a central and essential aspect in their patient care, education, and research missions will lead the nation toward achieving health equity. Groups that are underrepresented in medicine, including African Americans (3.0%), American Indians/Alaskan Natives (0.1%), people of Hispanic/Latino descent (4.2%), and Native Hawaiians/other Pacific Islanders (0.2%), constitute just 7.5% of the total medical school faculty in the United States¹—even though these populations constitute 30.0% of the overall U.S. population (2010 U.S. census). In addition, women constitute only 34% of faculty,¹ and self-reported data concerning sexual orientation, gender identity, and disability status of faculty are not uniformly collected and published. [Read more..](#)

Recognizing and Reckoning with Unconscious Bias: A Workshop for Health Professions Faculty Search Committees

Peter S. Cahn, PhD, MGH Institute of Health Professions, *Recognizing and Reckoning with Unconscious Bias: A Workshop for Health Professions Faculty Search Committees. MedEdPORTAL Publications*, 2017 Association of American Medical Colleges

Abstract

Introduction: As part of national efforts to reduce disparities in access to care, health professions schools have committed to increasing the proportion of faculty members from underrepresented minority groups. Responsibility for recruiting and vetting candidates for faculty positions, however, tends to rest in decentralized search committees that may receive no training in the science of human judgment. Simply as a

product of living in a stratified culture, we form unthinking stereotypes about certain groups of people. Fortunately, when people become sensitized to their unconscious biases, they can minimize cognitive errors. **Methods:** This 2-hour workshop is designed to introduce health professions faculty search committee members to the concept of unconscious bias and to spur reflection on how it can influence the decisions they make. In small-group activities, participants create and test materials that can facilitate their efforts to hire qualified candidates. **Results:** Search committee members who attended the workshop consistently rated it somewhat or very helpful in carrying out their roles. At one institution, the proportion of faculty members from underrepresented minority groups has increased each year that the workshop has been implemented. **Discussion:** The modules follow the work flow of a typical search process and are generalizable to any health professions department. While the challenge of diversifying the faculty involves many factors external to a university, calling search committee members' attention to unconscious bias is a strategy that faculty affairs officers can control.

By the end of this 2-hour workshop, the learner will be able to:

1. Define unconscious bias and explain its origins.
 2. Recognize how unconscious bias shapes judgments about candidates for health professions faculty positions.
 3. Generate ideas about how to minimize the impact of bias at different stages of the health professions faculty search process.
-

Gender and Racial Bias in Hiring

Correll, S. J. and S. Benard 2006. *Gender and Racial Bias in Hiring. Memorandum report for University of Pennsylvania* (March 21, 2006).

This memo reviews the literature on gender and racial biases in hiring and other workplace evaluations and proposes remedies to reduce these biases. It contains sections that provide:

1. background data on the under representation of minorities and women among American faculty;
 2. empirical evidence that cognitive biases in the evaluation of women and minority candidates contribute to their under representation;
 3. a theoretical framework for understanding the mechanisms that produce biased evaluations; and
 4. a series of proposed remedies derived from empirically supported theoretical accounts of how and why biases emerge and how they lead to disadvantages for women and minorities.
-

Reducing Bias in Academic Search Committees

Railey MT, Railey KM, Hauptman PJ. Reducing Bias in Academic Search Committees. *JAMA*.2016;316(24):2595-2596. doi:10.1001/jama.2016.17540

Diversifying the Faculty: A guidebook for Search Committees

Turner, Caroline Sotello Viernes. *Diversifying the Faculty: A Guidebook for Search Committees*. Association of American Colleges and Universities 2002. ISBN-0-911696-90-3

This monograph suggests ways in which an institution can diversify its faculty and facilitate the work of the search committee before a candidate ever reaches the interview stage. It outlines a step-by-step process to improve the likelihood of a successful search, and it recommends items to consider after a hire is confirmed to ensure that the new faculty member will be more likely to stay. The sections are: (1) Before the Search Begins; (2) The Search Process; and (3) After the Search. Appendixes contain a checklist of best practices, a list of leading institutions for minority Ph.D.s, a list of baccalaureate institutions identified as producers of numbers of female doctorates; and a list of Web resources of programs for building diverse faculties. An annotated bibliography lists 59 sources for additional information. (Contains 36 references.) (SLD) [Read more...](#)

Unconscious bias in faculty and leadership recruitment

April Corrice. *Unconscious Bias in Faculty and Leadership Recruitment: A Literature Review*. Association of American Medical Colleges. August 2009 Vol. 9 Num 2.

Rising Above Cognitive Errors: Guidelines for Search, Tenure Review, and Other Evaluation Committees.

Moody, JoAnn. (2007). *Rising Above Cognitive Errors: Guidelines For Search, Tenure Review And Other Evaluation Committees*. Moody Publications.

Description: This booklet explores this important question and provides steps for hastening faculty diversity with practical and feasible ways to improve faculty recruitment, retention, and mentorship, especially of under-represented women in science-related fields and non-immigrant minorities in all fields. The second edition of *Faculty Diversity* offers new insights, strategies, and caveats to the current state of faculty diversity. The revised edition includes:

- New strategies to prevent unintended cognitive bias and errors that damage faculty recruitment and retention
 - Expanded discussion on the importance of different cultural contexts, political, and historical experiences inhabited and inherited by non-immigrant faculty and students
 - Increased testimonials and on-the-ground reflections from faculty, administrators, and leaders in higher education, with new attention to medical and other professional schools
 - Updated Appendix with Discussion Scenarios and Practice Exercises useful to search and evaluation committees, department chairs, deans, faculty senates, and diversity councils
 - Expanded chapter on mentoring that dispels myths about informal mentoring and underlines essential components for formal programs.
-

Diversity & Inclusion Resources

The Physician Assistant Education Association (PAEA) delineates culturally-appropriate care, health disparities, health equity and bias, health literacy, LGBT inclusion and social determinants of health. A plethora of links and resources.

Proceedings of the Diversity & Inclusion Innovation Forum: Unconscious Bias in Academic Medicine
Association of American Medical Colleges with the Kirwan Institute for the Study of Race and Ethnicity.
Excellent review of the science of Unconscious Bias and how the prejudices we don't know we have affect
Medical Education, Medical Careers and Patient Health (2017)

Steps to Attracting, Recruiting, Hiring and Retaining a Diverse Workforce

Alev Dudek. Steps to Attracting, Recruiting, Hiring, and Retaining a Diverse Workforce. International Society for Diversity Management. 2012.

Description: Focused on staff recruitment. Diversity strategies need to be broad and effective to carry the organization into the future.

- **Diversity in the Recruitment Process.** To increase the ethnic diversity in an organization, a good strategy might be to find out what type of news and educational sources diverse well-educated people utilize and post job announcements at the appropriate locations, websites, newspapers, magazines, etc. The posting should clearly state that the organization values diversity and include a personalized statement explaining why.
 - **Diversity in the Hiring Process.** Avoid using grades exclusively to hire someone. They can be used in a package of criteria which could include recommendations from former employers or teachers, awards, certificates, personal development efforts, etc. Another strategy is to replace the educational requirement for a position with work experience and vice versa. Such flexibility will help attract more talented diverse candidates. No matter what the criteria, all candidates should be treated equally and asked the same questions. The more diverse and culturally sensitive the interviewing panel, the higher the chances for a fair hiring with a diverse outcome. Detailed and uninformed documentation is highly recommended.
 - **Diversity in Employee Retention.** The goal should be to spread diversity across the organization vertically and horizontally. To avoid extensive clustering would be to offer intercultural social events where employees from different departments can network with each other. Another effective way is to offer a flexible work schedule, flexible religious holiday options, kosher or vegan meals, etc. All new employees should be involved in a mandatory training session for a harassment free work environment. This will communicate that the organization takes diversity and inclusion seriously.
 - **Diversity and Separation.** Diversity management should be conducted in a similar manner as when hiring an employee.
-

Six Methods to Improve Your Diversity Recruiting

Emily Smykal 2015. Metrics to Improve your Diversity Recruiting in 2016. jibe.com

Description: The benefits of a diverse workforce cannot be overstated. Increases in innovation, creativity and candidate applications, along with reductions in turnover have all been attributed to diversity in the office.

Below are six different types of metrics and goals that clearly demonstrate the diversity of your workforce and help guide decision-making to achieve a more inclusive work environment.

1. **EEO Targets and Regulations.** Provide training and education on discrimination for all employees to help prevent this and harassment in the workforce.
2. **Current Levels of Changes in Minority Representation.** Keep track of the breakdown of the workforce. Minority representation typically refers to race or ethnicity, but it is important to consider other minority groups based on gender, age or disability. Determine which aspects of diversity you want to track then divide your workforce into those groups. Set a standard time period to collect these figures and chart the current and changing levels of diversity to identify areas for improvement.

3. **Current Levels of and Changes in Minority Representation** Among Levels and Departments. Once you have your overall minority representation measurement, breakdown that data across your company's different departments and levels of management.
 4. **Retention of Underrepresented Staff**. Create initiatives to reduce turnover; this is especially important for diversity efforts. The preference for diverse, inclusive workplaces is stronger today than ever as Millennial workers exhibit a more tolerant and inclusive approach to colleagues. They are the largest component of the U.S. labor force and the most diverse generation of workers.
 5. **Changes in Pay Disparities**. The general taboo against discussing different salaries among workers often prevents employees from even noticing a disparity. However, your recruitment team should be well positioned to note these differences and raise them with the appropriate managers. If all employees are paid fairly regardless of gender, race, or age, you have eliminated one major hurdle to retaining a diverse staff.
 6. **Sources of Diverse Candidates**. One final metric to consider is the source of your diverse applicants and employees. If you are already tracking where all of your candidates come from when they start and complete a job application, or when they are hired, you can combine that data with your minority representation figures. Budget decisions based on diversity goals and hiring needs can zero in on sources to achieve diversity in a more efficient way.
-

5 Simple Ways to Improve Diversity Hiring Practices in Your Organisation RIGHT NOW!

Siofra Pratt. 5 Simple Ways to improve diversity hiring practices in your organization. SocialTalent. 2015 Recruiting Website Blog. <https://www.socialtalent.co/blog/>

Hiring for diversity increases profitability - for every 1% increase in gender diversity, company revenue increases by 3%. Better Candidate Attraction - 67% of active and passive job seekers stated it is important to them that the company has a diverse workforce. More Engaged Employees - Diverse and more inclusive workforces demonstrate: 1.57x more collaboration among teams; 1.42x greater team commitment; 1.19x greater intent to stay with the company; 1.12x more discretionary effort.

- An important first step is to **take an Implicit Association Test**
 - **Standardize in Advance**. The most common form of bias is Performance Bias which tends to manifest in gender and race. **Make sure that each and every one of your hiring decisions is gender and race blind** by looking only at their skills. When submitting a short list to hiring managers **standardize all resumes** to remove any possible bias triggers which could include a candidate's name, and a university they attended.
 - **Use positive images and clues**. Research proves candidates are more likely to disengage from employers without any diversity-related cues, i.e., equal opportunity employer; **give a link back to the company's diversity policy**.
 - **Actively source minority candidates** in places they hang out.
-

Managing diversity through human resource management: an international perspective and conceptual framework

Jie Shen , Ashok Chanda , Brian D'Netto & Manjit Monga (2009) Managing diversity through human resource management: an international perspective and conceptual framework, The International Journal of Human Resource Management, 20:2, 235-251, DOI:10.1080/09585190802670516

Description: Measuring diversity and diversity management practices is strongly regarded as the initial step of HR diversity management practice. Many scholars have suggested organizations measure the identity profile or demographics of defined work groups, the dominant organizational culture, and the perceptions of various employee groups in order to identify cultural barriers that may hinder the full and effective participation of all employees. A critical analysis of the current HR diversity practices, such as recruitment and selection

procedures, criteria for entry into jobs, selection tools, diversity training programs, performance appraisal and compensation is also important. Periodic audits are necessary to identify the areas that require improvement.

- **Avoid is the A-S-A (attraction-selection-attrition) cycle** in order to develop multiple cultures in the organization. HR needs to be aware of the ways in which the interviewers' beliefs, attitudes, and stereotypes influence interview behavior.
 - **High quality diversity awareness training** is one HR function that enhances the effective integration of diverse group members. This builds a common understanding of the value of diversity, assisting in building social cohesion so that it improves individual and organizational outcomes. Critical to the success of education and training is the important step of **linking training to the strategic objectives of the organization**. Professional **development and career planning** is another area where discrimination is visible and needs careful attention. **Mentoring** is another strategy for managing diversity.
 - **Effective performance appraisal practices** should be objective **rather than subjective**, relevant to the job and the company, and fair to all employees with no special treatment offered. The focus should be on the individual's performance and not on the personality or race.
 - **Pay equality** contributes to effective diversity management and organizational performance. An individual-driven remuneration system facilitates individual lifestyles and further promotes diversity. Strong emphasis should be placed on **educating employees to understand diversity principles and accept their responsibilities, developing identity-based networking groups and targeting communications** to different affinity group members. **Flexible employment** provides individuals with the freedom to choose the working schedule based on their personal capacity.
-

Diversity at Work - Increasing Diversity through improved Recruitment and Hiring Practices

HR Council for the Nonprofit Sector (HR Council) of Canada. Website: <http://hrcouncil.ca/hr-toolkit/diversity-recruitment.cfm>

Areas of attention:

- **Advertising** in a wide variety of places including community boards, settlement service agencies, employment service centers, cultural community groups, local community centers, local ethnic and community newsletters or newspapers, etc.
- **Build relationships with cultural groups and organizations** that work with diverse communities. Contact local immigrant serving agencies that provide employment advice and services to learn about their programs.
- **Promote the organization** as a viable place to work. Partner with nonprofits to increase the sector's profile and attending job fairs and networking events increases an organization's visibility.
- **Connect with the volunteer base.**

Reduce bias in the selection process:

- **Specify the need**, rather than how it is achieved.
- **Ask for ability** wherever possible.
- **Ask for related work** experience.
- Focus on the qualities or knowledge needed to perform the work effectively.
- **Specify the kind of communication required.**
- **Specify the working conditions.**
- **Focus on the desired ability or skill** instead of a personal trait.

Recognize how personal bias can negatively impact diversity efforts. Suggestions to help reveal and remove bias that may affect who is selected for an interview, how the interview is conducted and final selection of candidates:

- **Develop a clear and consistent set of guidelines.**
- **Consider having one employee responsible** for receiving resumes in order to block the names of each candidate from those involved in the review and assessment of potential candidates.
- **Establish a recruitment philosophy** specifically focused on skills regardless of how those skills were developed or where a candidate was trained.
- **Focus on the content** rather than the style of the resume.
- **Avoid subjective terms** such as “best cultural fit”.

For a more inclusive interview process

- Include staff with a good understanding of cross-cultural issues.
 - Be informed of holy days of different religions to avoid scheduling interviews at those times.
 - Be aware that many disabilities are invisible.
 - Check assumptions around body language and other non-verbal communication.
-

Diversity: A key aspect of 21st century faculty roles as implemented in the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation Nurse Faculty Scholars Program

Summary: The purpose of the study is to present the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation Nurse Faculty Scholars program diversity initiatives and outcomes. Data on the diversity of the 90 scholars and their diversity-related leadership positions were compiled. Although the program was designed to encourage racial/ethnic and gender diversity, it was not until a diversity strategic plan was designed and implemented that sufficient diversity in the applicant pool and consistent diversity among the scholars was achieved.

Strategic Diversity Recruiting Process, It's the Process that Creates Success

William (Bill) Shackelford (2010) The Workforce Diversity Network (WDN) Blog.

http://workforcediversitynetwork.com/res_articles_strategicrecruiting_Shackelford.aspx

*This article is aimed at recruiting staff

Summary: Organizations that have achieved high levels of success in diversity staffing have one thing in common: **they all take a strategic approach in diversity recruiting.** They understand that long-term success comes from a process that starts with **building relationships within key sources** and includes **implementing strong strategies for retention.**

The Strategic Approach to Diversity Recruiting includes five components:

- (1) **Culture Shift** - This component requires organizations to identify and address the transformation required to create a culture that embraces diversity as a business imperative. This is usually accomplished through a formal assessment of the organizational culture and the implementation of changes recommended by the assessment.
- (2) **Outreach** - The goal of this component is to build a positive and consistent image of your organization in the minds of potential candidates, the people who influence them and the communities in which they live. Advertising, community outreach, supplier diversity programs and philanthropic efforts are all tools used for outreach.
- (3) **Recruiting** - The goal of the recruiting component is to identify and attract talent from a diverse pool and to ensure that every candidate is treated fairly throughout the hiring process. It is imperative that the candidates have a rewarding experience in their interactions with the organization. The screening process must remain bias-free without subtle biases or cultural sensitivity knowledge gaps.
- (4) **Retention** - Organizations often spend tens of thousands of dollars to hire a single candidate - thus retention can be essential to the financial bottom line. It is important for an organization to have strong on-boarding, mentoring, employee development and career counseling processes. Assessment of the need for employee support groups and creation of same if deemed necessary.
- (5) **Management Infrastructure** - This requires: a) developing strategic development; b) developing an implementation plan; c) ensuring coordination of all activities; d) ensuring success of the effort; and e) sustaining the effort over time.

Effective diversity recruiting programs are always driven from the top. The executive team must be committed and must demonstrate their commitment by providing the resources needed for success and by continuously inquiring about the status of the effort. Continuous evaluation, the removal of roadblocks and continuous process improvement are required for success. Leaders must prepare the organization for diversity not assume employees will automatically adjust to the changes.

Diversity Matters

Vivian Hunt, Dennis Layton, and Sara Prince. (PDF–1,732KB), *was re-released in February 2015. Performed by McKinsey & Company.*

**This is a study and focuses on leadership's role in creating diversity*

Summary: The most important drivers identified were advantages in recruiting the best talent, stronger customer orientation, increased employee satisfaction and improved decision making.

How can companies become more diverse?

Diversity in the top team and at all levels of an organization is best achieved through dedicated programs that focus on specific goals. Successful diversity programs have clear objectives and are led from the top (not just the CEO, but the entire top team). They foster active involvement from the wider organization and require the infrastructure to actively manage against targets to hold individuals accountable for outcomes. Some key steps are:

- Define a clear value proposition
- Establish a fact base
- Create targeted initiatives
- Define the governance model
- Build inclusion

Diversity matters. Most organizations have more work to do to take full advantage of the opportunity presented by a more diverse leadership team. They must also attract, develop, mentor, sponsor and retain the next generations of diverse leaders at all levels.

Enhancing Pediatric Workforce Diversity and Providing Culturally Effective Pediatric Care: Implications for Practice, Education, and Policy Making.

Committee on Pediatric Workforce. American Academy of Pediatrics. Enhancing Pediatric Workforce Diversity and Providing culturally Effective Pediatric Care. *Pediatrics* 2013; 132:e1105-e1116

Abstract : Article addresses workforce diversity, health disparities, and affirmative action. The discussion of diversity is broadened to include not only race, ethnicity, and language but also cultural attributes such as gender, religious beliefs, sexual orientation, and disability, which may affect the quality of health care. The AAP believes that efforts must be supported through health policy and advocacy initiatives to promote the delivery of CEHC and to overcome educational, organizational, and other barriers to improving workforce diversity.

Diversity Cues on Recruitment Websites: Investigating the Effects on Job Seeker's Information Processing

Walker, H.J., Field H.S., Bernerth, J.B. & Becton, J.B. (2012) Diversity Cues on recruitment websites: Investigating the effects on job seekers' information processing. *Journal of Applied Psychology*. 94, 214-224.
Abstract:

Although job seekers' motivation to process the information encountered during recruitment partially influences recruitment success, little is known about what motivates more thorough information processing. To address this issue, we integrated recruitment and social information processing theories to examine the possibility that diversity cues on recruitment websites influence website viewers' processing of presented information. Utilizing a controlled experiment and a hypothetical organization, Study 1 revealed that both Blacks and Whites spent more time viewing recruitment websites and better recalled website information when the sites included racial diversity cues. These relationships were stronger for Blacks, and organizational attractiveness perceptions mediated these effects for Blacks but not for Whites. Study 2 found similar relationships for Black and White participants viewing real organizational recruitment websites after taking into account perceived organizational attributes and website design effects. Implications of these findings for recruiting organizations are discussed.

Improving Diversity through Strategic Planning: A 10 year (2002-2012) experience at the Medical University of South Carolina

Pisano ED, Mainous AG 3rd, Johnson NG, Singleton MH, Gordon L, Taylor W, Hazen-Martin D, Burnham WS, Reves JG. Improving Diversity through Strategic Planning: A 10 year (2002-2012) experience at the Medical University of South Carolina. *Academic Medicine*: November 2012 - Volume 87 - Issue 11 - p 1548–1555
Description: Article describes the efforts of the MUSC, including recruitment and retention plans over a 10 yr period, emphasizing the role of the stakeholders promoting diversity, the value of annual assessment to evaluate outcomes and the positive benefits for individuals of all backgrounds.

Abstract: The Medical University of South Carolina launched a systematic plan to infuse diversity among its students, resident physicians, and faculty in 2002. The dean and stakeholders of the College of Medicine (COM) embraced the concept that a more population-representative physician workforce could contribute to the goals of providing quality medical education and addressing health care disparities in South Carolina. Diversity became a central component of the COM's strategic plan, and all departments developed diversity plans consistent with the overarching plan of the COM. Liaisons from the COM diversity committee facilitated the development of the department's diversity plans. By 2011, the efforts resulted in a doubling of the number of underrepresented-in-medicine (URM, defined as African American, Latino, Native American) students (21% of student body); matriculation of 10 African American males as first-year medical students annually for four consecutive years; more than a threefold increase in URM residents/fellows; expansion of pipeline programs; expansion of mentoring programs; almost twice as many URM faculty; integration of cultural competency throughout the medical school curriculum; advancement of women and URM individuals into leadership positions; and enhanced learning for individuals from all backgrounds. This article reports the implementation of an institutional plan to create a more racially representative workforce across the academic continuum. The authors emphasize the role of the stakeholders in promoting diversity, the value of annual assessment to evaluate outcomes, and the positive benefits for individuals of all backgrounds.

Building Diversity in a complex academic health center

Jeannette E. South-Paul, MD, Loren Roth, MD, MPH, Paula K. Davis, MA, Terence Chen, Anna Roman, PhD, Audrey Murrell, PhD, Chenits Pettigrew, EdD, Candi Castleberry-Singleton, MBA, and Joel Schuman, MD.
Building Diversity in a complex academic health center. *Academic Medicine* Issue: Volume 88(9), September 2013, p 1259–1264

Description: Authors describe the efforts at University of Pittsburgh who formed 4 committees to address communications and outreach, cultural competency, recruitment, and mentoring and retention. These efforts led to structural changes and improved allocation of resources to address diversity and inclusion and continue to address health disparities in the Pittsburgh community.

Abstract: For 30 years, the many diversity-related health sciences programs targeting the University of Pittsburgh undergraduate campus, school of medicine, schools of the health sciences, clinical practice plan, and medical center were run independently and remained separate within the academic health center (AHC). This lack of coordination hampered their overall effectiveness in promoting diversity and inclusion. In 2007, a group of faculty and administrators from the university and the medical center recognized the need to improve institutional diversity and to better address local health disparities. In this article, the authors describe the process of linking the efforts of these institutions in a way that would be successful locally and applicable to other academic environments. First, they engaged an independent consultant to conduct a study of the AHC's diversity climate, interviewing current and former faculty and trainees to define the problem and identify areas for improvement. Next, they created the Physician Inclusion Council to address the findings of this study and to coordinate future efforts with institutional leaders. Finally, they formed four working committees to address (1) communications and outreach, (2) cultural competency, (3) recruitment, and (4) mentoring and retention. These committees oversaw the strategic development and implementation of all diversity and inclusion efforts. Together these steps led to structural changes within the AHC and the improved allocation of resources that have positioned the University of Pittsburgh to achieve not only diversity but also inclusion and to continue to address the health disparities in the Pittsburgh community.

End Notes:

The building and maintenance of this resource is ongoing.

Resources and information across faculty and staff searches can have overlap and unique differences.

For help with phrases, word choice or information found therein please contact the School of Medicine Office of Diversity & Inclusion.

Disclaimer:

This tool was created *solely as a guide* for those seeking to make hiring practices more equitable and inclusive. This is not an official requirement of Duke University/Duke University Health System.

Disclaimer:

A number of resources for this tool have been provided from The Duke University/Health System Office for Institutional Equity (OIE) Faculty and Staff Recruitment and Hiring Guide website.

Duke University Institutional Statement of Commitment to Diversity and Inclusion

Duke aspires to create a community built on collaboration, innovation, creativity, and belonging. Our collective success depends on the robust exchange of ideas — an exchange that is best when the rich diversity of our perspectives, backgrounds, and experiences flourishes. To achieve this exchange, it is essential that all members of the community feel secure and welcome, that the contributions of all individuals are respected, and that all voices are heard. All members of our community have a responsibility to uphold these values.

