Promoting Humanistic Culture in Dental Education

ADEA Regional Accreditation Workshop
Philadelphia, PA
Thursday, April 25, 2013

Shelia S. Price, DDS, EdD
West Virginia University School of Dentistry
Associate Dean of Admissions, Recruitment & Access
Email: sprice@hsc.wvu.edu
Objectives

With regard to diversity, a multicultural environment and cultural competence within dental education, you will be able to:

• Define humanistic culture.
• Characterize humanistic learning environment.
• Describe programs and curricula to help create and sustain a humanistic culture and learning environment.
Historical Turning Point

- RWJF Dental Pipeline Program
- The California Endowment
- ADEA/W.K. Kellogg Access to Dental Careers
- A National Call to Action to Promote Oral Health
- ADEA Commission on Change and Innovation in Dental Education (CCI)
- Core Competencies for Interprofessional Collaborative Practice (IPE)
- CODA Revised Standards
What is Humanism?

Relationships
Humanism

• Describes relationships between physicians and their patients that are respectful and compassionate.

• Is reflected in attitudes and behaviors that are sensitive to the values, autonomy, cultural and ethnic backgrounds of others.

Reference: The Arnold P. Gold Foundation, Gold Humanism Honor Society,
http://humanism-in-medicine.org/index.php/aboutus/what_is_humanism_in_medicine
Humanistic Characteristics

- Integrity
- Excellence
- Compassion
- Altruism
- Respect
- Empathy
- Service

“IE, C.A.R.E.S.”

Reference: The Arnold P. Gold Foundation, Gold Humanism Honor Society,
http://humanism-in-medicine.org/index.php/aboutus/what_is_humanism_in_medicine
"It is much more important to know what kind of person has a disease, than what kind of disease a person has."

-Sir William Osler
“A humanistic pedagogy inculcates respect, tolerance, understanding, and concern for others and is fostered by mentoring, advising and small group interaction.”

Commission on Dental Accreditation. Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs. (Implementation July 1, 2013)
CCl Principles: Humanistic Environment

- Critical Thinking
- Lifelong and Self-Directed Learning
- Humanistic Environment
- Scientific Discovery and the Integration of Knowledge
- Evidence-Based Oral Health Care
- Assessment
- Faculty Development
- The Health Care Team

“A humanistic environment establishes a context for the development of interpersonal skills necessary for learning, for patient care, and for making meaningful contributions to the profession.”

Humanistic Environment

Why is it important?

- Model caring and enhance quality of care
- Enrich educational experiences
- Enhance mentoring opportunities and outcomes
- Improve access to healthcare
- Fulfill Accreditation Standards
“Cultural competence cannot be effectively acquired in a relatively homogeneous environment.”
Reference: CODA Accreditation Standards for Dental Education
Dimensions of Diversity

• Structural
• Curriculum
• Institutional Climate

Reference: Commission on Dental Accreditation: Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs. (Implementation July 1, 2013)
**ADEA Regional Accreditation Workshop**  
Philadelphia, PA  
April 25, 2013  

**Promoting and Assessing Humanistic Culture and Learning Environment in Dental School**

*Readiness Self-Assessment of Dimensions of Diversity in 2013 CODA Standards*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimensions of Diversity</th>
<th>Rate level of preparedness (Scale 1-3) 1=Unprepared 2=Prepared 3=Well prepared</th>
<th>To what degree and how are these dimensions exemplified? (Scale 1-5) 1=Poor; 2=Fair; 3=Good; 4=Very Good; 5=Excellent</th>
<th>What are the challenges to achieving these dimensions?</th>
<th>What are potential solutions to the identified challenges or barriers?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Structural</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Curriculum</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Institutional Climate</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Structural Diversity

- Recruit diverse classes
- Diversify admissions committees
- Utilize holistic application review
- Foster welcoming environment
- Develop mentor/advising programs
- Provide support and access to counseling
- Offer financial aid/scholarships
“Shopping” for Minority Students: A Not So Modest Proposal

April 2013 BDE, Vol 40, Issue 4

By Nicole Faustau

“You can spend all of your recruitment money running around to a whole bunch of colleges trying to pick up one or two diverse people where you can, or you can go to the grocery store that you know sells organic.”

This provocative statement drew considerable laughter and serious consideration from attendees at the ADEA Commission on Change and Innovation College Presidents’ Symposium at the 2013 ADEA Annual Session & Exhibition in Seattle. M. Christopher Brown II, Ph.D., President of Alcorn State University, had a lot to say on how dental schools might increase their enrollment of minority students, and this grocery store analogy summed up the crux of his recommendations.

“It’s your choice,” he told an attentive audience. “I don’t like to spend a lot of time shopping. I like to go in and get what I came for and get back out.”

So where should dental schools in search of minority candidates do their shopping? Dr. Brown enumerated the six types of institutions where minority students are clustered, including historically black colleges and universities (HBCUs) and tribal colleges that serve American Indians. He told the audience that HBCUs play a pivotal role in educating future black professionals, and he cited some impressive statistics to support his claim.

- HBCUs provide the undergraduate training for three quarters of all black persons holding a doctoral degree, three quarters of all black officers in the military forces, and four fifths of all black federal judges.
- Fifty percent of all black faculty in research institutions earned their undergraduate degrees at HBCUs.
- Seventy percent of all black dentists and physicians earned their undergraduate degrees at HBCUs.

“So you can run around to Swarthmore, Bryn Mawr. You can go to Harvard’s undergraduate recruitment fair all you want,” Dr. Brown concludes. “You’re not going to get this pool.”

So how can dental schools partner with HBCUs and other minority-serving institutions of higher learning to diversify their enrollment? Dr. Brown offered five innovative ways to build a new, more effective minority student pipeline.

1. Identify a set of target undergraduate institutions and maximize those relationships. He gave the example of an initiative between his home institution, a historically black land-grant institution in Lorman, Mississippi, and Penn State University (PSU). The partners use curriculum alignment and a bridge program to place Alcorn graduates in PSU’s Ph.D. programs, and eleven Alcorn graduates are currently pursuing Ph.D.s in the sciences at PSU.
New way to showcase schools and reach potential dental applicants

ADEA Virtual Fair

- 2012 inaugural event
- 33 dental schools
- 3200 attendees
Admissions

- Holistic File Review
- Diverse Committee
- Communications
  - Committee Mission Statement
  - Email/Web Presence
  - Offer Letter
Resources

- ADEA Admissions Committee Workshop resource: www.adea.org/transformingadmissions

University of Kentucky
Office of Institutional Diversity

http://www.uky.edu/diversity/
Curriculum Diversity (Classroom)
Student Orientation

- Raise awareness of getting prepared to treat diverse patients
  - Classroom-based sessions
  - Field trips

Reference:
Professionalism Assembly

Students read pledge in unison and sign document individually.
First-Year Dental and Medical Student Diversity Forum

- Expert Panel/Breakout Group Facilitators
- Case Studies
- Anonymous questions answered by panel
- The program helps students:
  1. learn about the University’s commitment to diversity, inclusiveness, and social justice
  2. identify biases, stereotypes and assumptions that are counterproductive to delivery of quality health care
  3. identify barriers and solutions to effective communication in diverse environments
White Coat Ceremony

• “Cloak of Compassion”

• Reaffirms commitment to professionalism

• Symbolizes dedication to quality patient care
Course Content

- Social Justice Statement
- Competencies for the Graduating Dentist
- Standards
- CODA
- Infusion Method
Preventive Dentistry Course

• 1st year Dental Curriculum
• “Culture and Preventive Attitudes & Practice”
• **Goal**
  – To discuss the relationship between cultural awareness and promotion to preventative attitudes and oral health practices
• **Objectives**
  – Define cultural competence and explain the rationale for cultural sensitivity in the oral health care setting
  – Understand the importance of effective cross-cultural communication in the oral health care environment
  – Understand barriers to optimal oral health for culturally diverse patient populations
  – Discuss culturally sensitive strategies to promote preventive attitudes and to improve oral health
Law & Ethics Course

• 3rd Year Dental Curriculum
• “Improving Access to Oral Health Care: Rationale and Basic Approaches”

• Objectives
  – Students have the opportunity to:
    1. Examine the rationale for enhancing cultural awareness in dental education
    2. Discuss barriers to quality oral health care
    3. Explore helpful solutions to improve access to oral health care
Senior Service Learning Program

Kelly A. Gould, RDH, MA, Course Director
Creighton University School of Dentistry
Senior Seminar

“Utilizing Interpreters to Enhance Cross-Language Communication in the Clinical Environment”

• Objectives
  – Underscore the relevance of effective cross-language communication to quality health care
  – Discuss interpreter selection and roles
  – Illustrate the use of interpreters in the clinical setting

Paul Glassman, DDS, MBA
University of the Pacific
Arthur A. Dugoni School of Dentistry
Dimensions of Diversity

- Structural/Compositional
- Curriculum/Classroom
- **Institutional Climate**
Impediments to Humanistic Environment

• Generalizing
• Stereotyping
STEREOTYPES

- Assumptions based on perceptions
- Learned early and difficult to unlearn
- Does not consider if assumptions are correct or incorrect
- Negative stereotypes are usually remembered (rather than positive ones)

Reference: Melissa Welch MD, MPH
Labeling

The purpose of this exercise is to have students examine stereotypes and generalizations in a fun, yet safe and serious environment.

QUESTIONS

What did you experience?

What did people say to you?

How did you feel about these comments?

Were you able to recognize your label?

Were you comfortable with it?

How might this relate to other experiences you have had?

Did you begin to act your label? Why?

How will you use this experience in the future?

Source: Ronald W. Botto, MS, PhD, Associate Professor, University of Kentucky College of Denistry
Communication

- Community Service
  - Improvement of dental health of the public
- Development of a Profession
  - Support of the professional society and the rule of ethics
- Planning and Development
  - Inform the public of the benefits of their organizations
Communication Concepts

• Association

  Prior associations impact communication.

• Conscious vs. Unconscious Communication

  Much of communication is unconscious.

• Expectations

Building Blocks for Effective Communication

- Preparation
- Introduction
- Interview

Listen
Explain
Acknowledge
Recommend
Negotiate

Interprofessional Education (IPE)
Values/Ethics for Interprofessional Practice

- Place the interests of patients and populations at the center of interprofessional health care delivery.
- Respect the dignity and privacy of patients while maintaining confidentiality in the delivery of team-based care.
- Embrace the cultural diversity and individual differences that characterize patients, populations, and the health care team.
- Respect the unique cultures, values, roles/responsibilities, and expertise of other health professions.
- Work in cooperation with those who receive care, those who provide care, and others who contribute to or support the delivery of prevention and health services.
- Develop a trusting relationship with patients, families, and other team members (CIHC, 2010).
- Demonstrate high standards of ethical conduct and quality of care in one’s contributions to team-based care.
- Manage ethical dilemmas specific to interprofessional patient/population centered care situations.
- Act with honesty and integrity in relationships with patients, families, and other team members.
- Maintain competence in one’s own profession appropriate to scope of practice.
Roles/Responsibilities for Collaborative Practice

- Communicate one’s roles and responsibilities clearly to patients, families, and other professionals.
- Recognize one’s limitations in skills, knowledge, and abilities.
- Engage diverse healthcare professionals who complement one’s own professional expertise, as well as associated resources, to develop strategies to meet specific patient care needs.
- Explain the roles and responsibilities of other care providers and how the team works together to provide care.
- Use the full scope of knowledge, skills, and abilities of available health professionals and healthcare workers to provide care that is safe, timely, efficient, effective, and equitable.
- Communicate with team members to clarify each member’s responsibility in executing components of a treatment plan or public health intervention.
- Forge interdependent relationships with other professions to improve care and advance learning.
- Engage in continuous professional and interprofessional development to enhance team performance.
- Use unique and complementary abilities of all members of the team to optimize patient care.
Interprofessional Communication

- Choose effective communication tools and techniques, including information systems and communication technologies, to facilitate discussions and interactions that enhance team function.
- Organize and communicate information with patients, families, and healthcare team members in a form that is understandable, avoiding discipline-specific terminology when possible.
- Express one’s knowledge and opinions to team members involved in patient care with confidence, clarity, and respect, working to ensure common understanding of information and treatment and care decisions.
- Listen actively, and encourage ideas and opinions of other team members.
- Give timely, sensitive, instructive feedback to others about their performance on the team, responding respectfully as a team member to feedback from others.
- Use respectful language appropriate for a given difficult situation, crucial conversation, or interprofessional conflict.
- Recognize how one’s own uniqueness, including experience level, expertise, culture, power, and hierarchy within the healthcare team, contributes to effective communication, conflict resolution, and positive interprofessional working relationships (University of Toronto, 2008).
- Communicate consistently the importance of teamwork in patient-centered and community-focused care.
Interprofessional Teamwork and Team-based Care

- Describe the process of team development and the roles and practices of effective teams.
- Develop consensus on the ethical principles to guide all aspects of patient care and team work.
- Engage other health professionals—appropriate to the specific care situation—in shared patient-centered problem-solving.
- Integrate the knowledge and experience of other professions—appropriate to the specific care situation—to inform care decisions, while respecting patient and community values and priorities/preferences for care.
- Apply leadership practices that support collaborative practice and team effectiveness.
- Engage self and others to constructively manage disagreements about values, roles, goals, and actions that arise among healthcare professionals and with patients and families.
- Share accountability with other professions, patients, and communities for outcomes relevant to prevention and health care.
- Reflect on individual and team performance for individual, as well as team, performance improvement.
- Use process improvement strategies to increase the effectiveness of interprofessional teamwork and team-based care.
- Use available evidence to inform effective teamwork and team-based practices.
- Perform effectively on teams and in different team roles in a variety of settings.
Senior Seminar

• Interprofessional Panel: “Our Changing Culture and Patient Care”

• Attended by dental students and faculty

• Goal:
  To promote mutual understanding and respect toward people from other cultures and to provide essential tools that foster positive interactions.

Global Health Week

Interprofessional panel:

1) Increases awareness of diverse cultures in the global community

2) Identifies challenges and approaches to cross-cultural health care

3) Prepares individuals to be more culturally proficient
Interprofessional Teaching & Learning

- Culture and Health Special Topics

Course objectives

- Increase interdisciplinary awareness about culture and health
- Examine the role of culture in health care and its multifaceted domains, comparing and contrasting different cultures
- Provide opportunity for development of skills necessary for culturally based health assessment, communication, and care
Multidisciplinary UnSheltered Homeless Relief Outreach Of Morgantown (MUSHROOM)

• Interprofessional outreach to the homeless

• Alternating Thursday evenings

• Distribute oral health aids and other basic personal care items

• Discuss income-based and free-care clinics
Institutional Climate
(Interactional Diversity)
Studentdoctor.net

Who posts to this site?

• Pre-dental students
• Dental students
• Dentists
• Members/guests

Positive and negative commentary!
“The teacher who is indeed wise, does not bid you to enter the house of his wisdom, but rather leads you to the threshold of your mind.”

- Kahlil Gibran
Vision

Leadership

MISSION
Sample Mission Statements

Vision & Mission

Vision
The vision of the College of Dentistry is to be an internationally recognized dental school known for an innovative educational program, commitment to cultural diversity, discovery, transfer of scientific knowledge, the superior skills of our graduates, and the highest degree of service.

Mission
The mission of the College of Dentistry is to achieve excellence in the art and science of dentistry through teaching, research, and service:
- To develop outstanding clinical, research and teaching professionals committed to lifelong learning.
- To provide and promote excellent patient care and community service.
- To discover, disseminate and apply knowledge in the oral health sciences.
- To foster an environment that promotes communication, cultural diversity, and internationalization and ensures further alignment of the College with the vision and mission of the University of Florida.

Reference: http://dental.ufl.edu/about/college-information/vision-mission/

School of Dental Medicine

Vision, Mission & Values’ Statement

Vision
Improving the health and quality of life of all North Carolinians by creating leaders with a passion to care for the underserved and by leading the nation in community-based, service learning oral health education.

Mission
The mission of the East Carolina University School of Dental Medicine is to:
- Prepare leaders with outstanding clinical skills, an ethical bearing, sound judgment, and a passion to serve.
- Provide educational opportunities for individuals from historically underrepresented groups, disadvantaged backgrounds, and underserved areas.
- Provide and enhance oral health services for underserved North Carolinians through implementation of community-oriented service learning and interprofessional collaborations.
- Foster an environment where creativity, collaboration, and diversity are embraced.
- Guide future clinical practice and dental education through innovation and discovery.

Reference: https://author.ecu.edu/cs-dhs/dentistry/mission.cfm
MISSION STATEMENT
IMPLEMENTATION AND TRANSLATION
INTO DAILY PRACTICE

Are we modeling/practicing what we teach?
Humanistic Environment

- “Beans with the Dean”
- Student representation on standing committees
- Student advisory board
- Student advising and mentoring
- Informal social opportunities
- Senior exit interviews
Faculty Development

“Alumni Perspectives: Promoting Careers in Dentistry for Ethnic Minority Students”

Faculty learn firsthand about issues uniquely affecting ethnic minority students.
Leadership
Benefits of a Humanistic Education: Student Perspective

“The humanistic model provides a positive environment that allows young dentists to focus on their schoolwork, grow as leaders, and learn the importance of organized dentistry and collaboration…”

“I write this article to encourage dental faculty, staff, and especially deans to consider taking a look at the environment at your school.”

Humanistic Environment

Examples from the University of Michigan School of Dentistry

- Hired a part-time counselor to help promote personal wellness among dental hygiene, DDS, and grad students

- Development Sessions:
  - For students: Sleep Deprivation
  - For faculty: “Creating a positive Learning Environment”

- Assigned each student a faculty mentor

- Instituted “flex time” which means that students have off one afternoon.

- Re-configured study spaces to provide mixtures of quiet spaces and collaborative spaces.
Student Leadership

• Curriculum Committee
• Diversity Task Force
• Admissions Committee
• Recruitment Committee
• Other
2012 Student Ambassador Program

- 2012 Student Ambassador Program
  Saturday, 10/20/12, Hilton San Francisco Hotel, San Francisco, CA
- In conjunction with the ADA Annual Session
- Highlighting model student-initiated outreach and recruitment efforts
- Furthering collaborations with Admission Offices, Prehealth Advisors and others

Sponsored by the ADA Career Guidance and Diversity Activities Committee with representatives from the ADEA, ASDA, HDA, NAAHP, NDA, SAID, student groups and others.

Special thanks to the American Dental Education Association for generous support of the 2012 program
Faculty and students share perspectives on cross cultural teaching and learning.

Dental student discusses his first mission trip to Africa.
Student Mentoring

East Carolina University

- Big Brother/Big Sister Programs
- Advisor/Student Teams (1st year)
- Faculty/Student Mentor Pairs (2nd year)
- Student Mentoring in partnership with NC Dental Society
  - Optional, one-year renewable mentor dyads
  - Students select from list of dentist volunteers
  - Reception for mentor teams at state dental meeting
Endnotes

• Integrate diversity and cultural awareness into new faculty/staff/student orientation

• Engage diverse groups in holistic assessment

• Foster interprofessional programs

• Develop “best practices”

• Anchor humanistic culture to vision, mission, and strategic plan
López MA, Ph.D., Nihill P. Strengthening Diversity and Inclusion: The Power of Alliances

McCann A, Miller B, Lacy E. The Impact of Culture on Underrepresented Minority Health Profession

Palatta A, Hsu H, McQuistan M. Diversity Defined: Is Your Institution Ready?

http://www.hrsa.gov/culturalcompetence/index.html
CURA PERSONALIS

“Care for the Person”
Acknowledgement

A special thanks to colleagues at various U.S. dental schools who shared their humanistic initiatives for use in this presentation.